

[Asia Pac J Sci T] Editor Decision

saepurahman@yah.../Inbox



Asia-Pacific Journal of Science and Tech Editor via Thai Journals Online (ThaiJO) <admin@tci-thaij
o.org>

22 Apr 2021 at 4:16 pm

To: Saepurahman S <saepurahman@yahoo.com>, Raed Hashaikeh <raed.hashaikeh@nyu.edu>,
Teguh Kurniawan <teguh@untirta.ac.id>

Saepurahman S, Raed Hashaikeh, Teguh Kurniawan:

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Asia-Pacific Journal of Science and Technology, "Alkaline leaching & Recrystallization of H-Y zeolites post Ball Milling".

Our decision is to: Accept for submission.

Asia-Pacific Journal of Science and Tech Editor
apst.kku@gmail.com

Best regards,
Mr. Kitimasak Sittijanda

Editorial Assistant
Asia-Pacific Journal of Science and Technology
Division of Research Administration
Khon Kaen University, Thailand
Tel. +66-4320-3178
Email: apst.kku@gmail.com

[Asia Pac J Sci T] Submission Acknowledgement

saepurahman@yah.../Inbox



Editor of Asia-Pacific Journal of Science and Technology via Thai Journals Online (ThaiJO) <admin@tci-thaijo.org>
To: Saepurahman S <saepurahman@yahoo.com>

14 Dec 2020 at 3:17 pm

Saepurahman S:

Thank you for submitting the manuscript, "Alkaline leaching & Recrystallization of H-Y zeolites post Ball Milling" to Asia-Pacific Journal of Science and Technology. With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site:

Manuscript URL: <http://so01.tci-thaijo.org/index.php/APST/authorDashboard/submission/245077>

Username: saepurahman

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Editor of Asia-Pacific Journal of Science and Technology

- Notific
- [Asia
- Revis
- Revis
- Revis
- Urgen
- Revis

Editorial Assistant
Asia-Pacific Journal of Science and Technology
Division of Research Administration
Khon Kaen University, Thailand
Tel. +66-4320-3178
Email: apst.kku@gmail.com

Dear Mr. Kitimasak Sittijanda, saepurahman
2021-04-20 12:14 PM

I adjusted my responses to the reviewer's comments to include page and line of revision whenever applicable by highlighting in yellow. Please let me know if there is anything missing.

Thank you and Best Regards,
Saepurahman

- saepurahman, Response to_245077-Other-879658-1-18-20210405_.docx
- saepurahman, Response to_245077-Other-879659-1-18-20210405_.docx
- saepurahman, Response to_245077-Other-879660-1-18-20210405_.docx

Dear Author, kkurj
2021-04-20 03:04 PM

We thank so much for your prompt response. I send it to our editors and reviewers and will get back to you.

Best regards,
Mr. Kitimasak Sittijanda

Editorial Assistant
Asia-Pacific Journal of Science and Technology
Division of Research Administration
Khon Kaen University, Thailand
Tel. +66-4320-3178
Email: apst.kku@gmail.com

Add Message

Request for major revision

Participants

APST Journal (kkurj)
Saepurahman S (saepurahman)

Messages

Note	From
<p>Dear Author,</p> <p>Thank you for submitting your manuscript 245077, entitled "<i>Alkaline leaching & Recrystallization of H-Y zeolites post Ball Milling</i>" to Asia-Pacific Journal of Science and Technology (APST). The editorial team and a group of expert reviewers have assessed your submission and feel that it has potential for publication, and so we would like to invite you to revise the paper and resubmit for further review. There were some concerns raised with regard to major revision.</p> <p>Please see the attached reviewer comments for further details about necessary revisions. We ask that you submit the revised version of your manuscript. Please note, your revised manuscript should be accompanied by a summary of your responses to the reviewers' comments. And you should also make 3 answer sheets based on each reviewers' comment and indicate the page and line which you revise.</p> <p>You have 2 weeks to respond to this revise and resubmit request ending on Apr. 19 2021. Please feel free to contact me with any questions.</p> <p>Best regards,</p> <p>Mr. Kitimasak Sittijanda</p> <p>Editorial Assistant Asia-Pacific Journal of Science and Technology Division of Research Administration Khon Kaen University, Thailand</p>	kkurj 2021-04-05 10:33 AM

- Notific
- [Asia
- Revi
- Revi
- Revi
- Revi
- Name
- Urgen
- Revi

- kkurj, 245077 Comment from reviewer A.docx
- kkurj, 245077 Comment from reviewer B.docx
- kkurj, 245077 Comment from reviewer C.docx

Dear Mr. Kitimasak Sittijanda

Herewith I attach my response to the comments given by the reviewers. I also attached the manuscript after revision following the reviewer's suggestions. Thank you.

Best Regards,

Saepurahman

- saepurahman, 245077-Other-865204-1-18-20201221_revised to reviewers suggestions.docx
- saepurahman, Response to_245077-Other-879658-1-18-20210405.docx
- saepurahman, Response to_245077-Other-879659-1-18-20210405.docx
- saepurahman, Response to_245077-Other-879660-1-18-20210405.docx

saepurahman
2021-04-19 11:29 PM

I include summary of my response to the reviewer's comments and suggestion.

- saepurahman, Summary of responses to Reviewers comments.docx

saepurahman
2021-04-19 11:47 PM

Dear Author,

Please answer the reviewers' comment point by point in 3 answering sheets and send it back.

Please note that you have to **indicate the page and line which you revise.**

Thank you in advance for your cooperation, we appreciate.

Best regards,

Mr. Kitimasak Sittijanda

Editorial Assistant
Asia-Pacific Journal of Science and Technology
Division of Research Administration

kkurj
2021-04-20 11:16 AM

ASIA-PACIFIC JOURNAL OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY REVIEW FORM

This review form is to be used for all submissions to the articles section.

ID: 245077 Reviewer: C

Title : Alkaline leaching & Recrystallization of H-Y zeolites post Ball Milling

1. Title

LINE 1: The title of an article must not include symbol (&), hence author should adjust the title into : "Alkaline Leaching and".

Answer:

The title has been modified to "Nano Y zeolite particles preparation by top-down approach" to make it more appealing (Page 1 Line 1)

2. Abstract

Abstract written has summarized what the author did and highlight the key findings. Several adjustments needed:

LINE 10: "...Environmentally way.."--->should be adjusted

Answer:

It has been adjusted to environmentally "friendly way" (Page 1 Line 11)

LINE 13: The word "preliminary study" is ambiguous, since it could refer to other study that has been performed previously before this submitted article.

Answer:

The word preliminary has been removed (Page 1 Line 13)

LINE 14: The author should include the chemical used for alkaline leaching.

Answer:

The sentence has been adjusted to include "using NaOH" (Page 1 Line 14)

3. Introduction and Objectives

Author stated clear introductions and objectives.

4. Methodology

Methodologies stated briefly in a concise manner. However, several informations need be to added:

LINE 87: How many grams of zeolite per mL NaOH reacted during alkaline leaching? The information should be added inside the methodology.

The sentence has been adjusted to "by mixing 1 g of zeolite NPs after BM with 20 mL of NaOH solution 0.1 M" (Page 2 Line 87)

Answer

LINE 92-96: Information on the duration of the heating treatment should be added, as well as the mass/amount of NaOH, colloidal silica, aluminum isopropoxide and water added to produce such compound with specific molecular formula. And also, duration needed to be able to recover the solid product.

Answer:

The sentences have been modified to

“Recrystallization was done by mixing the zeolite NPs with a dilute aluminosilicate solution [10]. The dilute aluminosilicate solution was prepared by mixing 3.2397 g of NaOH, 0.7560 g of colloidal silica, 0.0408 g of aluminum isopropoxide and 53.82 g of water in a plastic bottle which was heated at 90 °C for 1 h in an oven to dissolve the solids and obtain a solution having a composition of 405Na₂O:1Al₂O₃:51SiO₂:29900H₂O. After all the solids were dissolved, the zeolite NPs were added. After certain duration (10, 20, 60, and 90 min), the solid product was recovered using centrifugation and then characterized using XRD.”

(Page 2 and 3 Line 92-96)

LINE 100: The author should state the XRD characterization was carried out using which equipment.

Answer:

It was written in Page 3 Line 99-100: Phase crystallinity of the ball milled samples were determined using a Bruker D2 phaser desktop diffractometer.

5. Results

LINE 105-107. If SEM was used to determine the crystallinity index (CI), elaborate more on how the author determine the changes on the CI.

Answer:

XRD is used to determine crystallinity.

In accordance with previous report [7], crystallinity index (%) was determined by comparing the total area (after background subtraction) of peaks at 15.7, 18.7, 23.7, 27.1, 30.8, 31.5, and 34.2° of ball milled zeolite and parent sample; taking the parent sample as 100% crystalline.

6. Conclusion

Conclusion have the necessary information

7. Other comment

8. Decisions*

Accept

Revision Required

Resubmit for Review

Decline Submission

ASIA-PACIFIC JOURNAL OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY REVIEW FORM

This review form is to be used for all submissions to the articles section.

ID: 245077 Reviewer: A

Title : Alkaline leaching & Recrystallization of H-Y zeolites post Ball Milling

1. Title

2. Abstract

The abstract should be explained about this work, do not need to give the other contents too much.

Answer:

The abstract (Page 1 Line 5-8) has been adjusted to make it simpler. Since the journal is not focused on zeolite chemistry, a brief introduction was kept for general readers to understand.

3. Introduction and Objectives

This part is all right.

4. Methodology

The authors should state more in detail that why selected to measure outcomes at day four?

Answer:

The alkaline leaching and recrystallization studies do not involved experimentation until four days or more.

Was the study approved by ethic committee?

Answer:

This study involves no medical experimentation and human subjects; hence ethic committee approval is not required.

5. Results

The result may not be enough to be evidence in this work. It must show the other result such as crystallinity size, XPS spectra. The author must explain the effect of alkaline concentration on the recrystallization.

Answer:

The crystallinity size (Index) is not calculated since the sample becomes amorphous after alkaline leaching and turns into different topology after recrystallization.

We believe that XPS spectroscopy is not required since we focused on exploring methods to improve the crystallinity of nano Y zeolite after ball milling and that XPS spectroscopy less informative on crystallinity.

We did not vary the concentration of the alkaline (NaOH) in the dilute aluminosilicate solution, we stucked to the previous reported recipe for it.

6. Conclusion

The result wasn't enough to conclusion.

Answer:

This study serves as explorative study to improve crystallinity of ball milled Y zeolite. In this tudy, we present what we have found so far.

7. Other comment

8. Decisions*

- Accept
- Revision Required
- Resubmit for Review
- Decline Submission

ASIA-PACIFIC JOURNAL OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY REVIEW FORM

This review form is to be used for all submissions to the articles section.

ID: 245077 Reviewer: B

Title : Alkaline leaching & Recrystallization of H-Y zeolites post Ball Milling

1. Title

The title is fine and it give indication for the work has been conducted, however, it would more appealing if it changed to " Nano Y zeolite particles preparation by top-down approach"

Answer:

The title has been modified following the suggestion given (Page 1 Line 1)

2. Abstract

The abstract need to be improved by providing conclusion of the work and terming the unnecessary general information.

Answer:

The abstract (Page 1 Line 5-8) has been revised to make it simpler. Since the journal is not focused on zeolite chemistry, a brief introduction was kept for general readers to understand.

3. Introduction and Objectives

The introduction and the objectives are well written

4. Methodology

Some information such as the re-crystallization time should be stated in the experimental work.

Answer:

The sentences have been revised to improve clarity (Page 2 and 3 Line 92-96)

“Recrystallization was done by mixing the zeolite NPs with a dilute aluminosilicate solution [10]. The dilute aluminosilicate solution was prepared by mixing 3.2397 g of NaOH, 0.7560 g of colloidal silica, 0.0408 g of alumium isopropoxide and 53.82 g of water in a plastic bottle which was heated at 90 °C for 1 h in an oven to dissolve the solids and obtain a solution having a composition of 405Na₂O:1Al₂O₃:51SiO₂:29900H₂O. After all the solids were dissolved, the zeolite NPs were added. After certain duration (10, 20, 60, and 90 min), the solid product was recovered using centrifugation and then characterized using XRD.”

Was the study approved by ethic committee?

Answer:

This study involves no medical experimentation and human subject; hence ethic committee approval is not required.

5. Results

It is much better to provide the XRD results of the commercial Y zeolites to have a well imagination about the effect of the ball milling and desilication processes.

Answer:

The XRD pattern of parent sample is too intense that it obscured the ball milled sample as seen in our previous study [7]. For that reason, it is omitted in this present graph.

6. Conclusion

The conclusion is fine

7. Other comment

8. Decisions*

Accept

Revision Required

Resubmit for Review

Decline Submission