



iqbal syaichurrozi &lt;iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com&gt;

---

**[JBAT] Submission Acknowledgement**

1 message

- &lt;jurnal.bat@mail.unnes.ac.id&gt;

Tue, Sep 13, 2022 at 1:19 AM

To: Iqbal Syaichurrozi &lt;iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com&gt;

Iqbal Syaichurrozi:

Thank you for submitting the manuscript, "COMPARISON OF ALUM AND POLY ALUMINIUM CHLORIDE AT VARIOUS DOSES IN COAGULATION PROCESS ON COLOR REMOVAL OF PALM OIL MILL EFFLUENT" to Jurnal Bahan Alam Terbarukan. With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site:

Manuscript URL:

<https://journal.unnes.ac.id/nju/index.php/jbat/author/submission/38885>

Username: syaichurrozi

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

-

Jurnal Bahan Alam Terbarukan

---

Jurnal Bahan Alam Terbarukan (Journal of Natural Resources)<http://journal.unnes.ac.id/nju/index.php/jbat>

Jurnal Bahan Alam Terbarukan

## Editor/Author Correspondence

Editor  
2022-09-27 11:45 AM

Subject: [JBAT] Editor Decision

Delete

Iqbal Syaichurrozi:

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Jurnal Bahan Alam Terbarukan entitled "COMPARISON OF ALUM AND POLY ALUMINIUM CHLORIDE AT VARIOUS DOSES IN COAGULATION PROCESS ON COLOR REMOVAL OF PALM OIL MILL EFFLUENT". Based on the reviewers' recommendations, the manuscript requires MINOR REVISIONS before it can be reconsidered for publication in the JBAT. The comments from the reviewer(s) can be found in the attachment.

best regards,

Dr. Megawati Megawati  
Scopus ID: 36959759900 Department of Chemical Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia  
megawati@mail.unnes.ac.id

---

Jurnal Bahan Alam Terbarukan (Journal of Natural Resources)  
<http://journal.unnes.ac.id/nju/index.php/jbat>

Close

<b>Reviewer's comments</b>	<b>Authors' responses</b>
<b>#Reviewer A</b>	
<b>Introduction</b>	
<p>Page 1: Even if author use a reference manager, please check all the inputs start from the name until the doi of the article.</p> <p>Please make sure in the name section, that it is already separated by the last name, first name. If it is correctly entered there wont be any mistakes like this.</p> <p>It should be cited as (Azis, 2018)</p>	Thank you. We have revised it.
Page 1: Replace "dan" with "&"	Thank you. We have revised it.
<b>Results and Discussion</b>	
<p>Page 5: Figure 2 : Still in Indonesian language If the x axis is changed to a narrower range, it can be seen the dynamic change of pH during the coagulation process</p>	Thank you. We have revised the Figure 2. Please check the Figure 2 on Page 7
Page 6: Comparison between Alum and PAC on the Color Removal "efficiency?"	Thank you. We have revised "Comparison between Alum and PAC on the Color Removal" to "Comparison between Alum and PAC on the Color Removal Efficiency". Please check on Page 8
Page 7: "(Zouboulis et al., 2008)" In text citation must be in this format : Author lastname (year)	Thank you. We have revised to "Zouboulis et al. (2008)"
<p>Page 9: Table 2: Why the error for low dose of coagulant have huge error? Explain in the paragraph.</p>	Thank you. We have added explanations: "Based on Tables 1 and 2, by using second-order kinetic model, the MAPE value at coagulant dose of 2 g/L was higher than that at other coagulant doses, which was 21.62% and 19.06% for alum and PAC, respectively. It might be caused by the complex organic compounds in POME. However these MAPE values were below 25%. The model resulting in MAPE value below 25% shows the excellent prediction (Estévez et al., 2020). Therefore, in this study, the second-order kinetic model was still good in predicting the color removal efficiency at various coagulant doses with coagulant type of alum and PAC." Please check on Page 11
<b>Conclusion</b>	
Page 10: Used "." For the decimal separator.	Thank you. We have revised it. Please check Line 12.

<b>Reviewer's comments</b>	<b>Authors' responses</b>
<b>#Reviewer B</b>	
<b>Introduction</b>	
Page 1: (Statista, 2021), Check journal's guideline on quotation. It should be written: "... by Author (years)".	Thank you. We have revised it.
Page 1: Please add other hazardous characteristics (and references) from POME to support this statement.	Thank you. "The POME has a color of dark brown (Rakhmania et al., 2022) and contains a high chemical oxygen demand (COD) content of 42,500-86,300 mg/L and a high biological oxygen demand (BOD) content of 21,500-55,200 mg/L (Najafpour et al., 2006; Singh et al., 2013; Wang et al., 2015) so it can pollute the water bodies if it is discharged directly." Please check Page 2 Lines 27-30.
Page 1: (Tetteh dan Rathilal, 2019), Check journal's guideline on quotation, for two authors it should use "&".	Thank you. We have revised it.
Page 1: (Ismail et al., 2014), Same as 1st comment. Please check and revise.	Thank you. We have revised it.
Page 2: (Tan et al., 2006), Same as 1st comment. Please check and revise.	Thank you. We have revised it.
Page 2: (Ahmad et al., 2005), Same as 1st comment. Please check and revise.	Thank you. We have revised it.
Page 2: (Chung et al., 2018), Same as 1st comment. Please check and revise.	Thank you. We have revised it.
<b>Results and discussion</b>	
Page 5 Line 16: ".....were still dispersed in the liquid", Please include references that support this finding.	Thank you. We have added information: "A previous study also reported that too much coagulant (watermelon seed) dose was not effective to remove total dissolved solid, turbidity and color of the river water (Ernest et al., 2017)." Please check Page 6 Lines 21-23.
Page 5: Figure 2 : Axis titles should be in English. Please revise.	Thank you. We have revised it.
Page 6: Figure 3: Axis titles should be in English. Please revise.	Thank you. We have revised it.
Page 7: (Zouboulis et al., 2008), Same as 1st comment. Please check and revise.	Thank you. We have revised it.
Page 8: Figure 4: Axis titles should be in English. Please revise.	Thank you. We have revised it.
Page 9: Figure 5: Axis titles should be in English. Please revise.	Thank you. We have revised it.



iqbal syaichurrozi &lt;iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com&gt;

---

**JBAT Final Decision**

1 message

---

**Jurnal BAT** <jurnal.bat@mail.unnes.ac.id>  
To: iqbal syaichurrozi <iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com>

Wed, Oct 5, 2022 at 3:08 PM

Dear Iqbal

Your manuscript, entitled "COMPARISON OF ALUM AND POLY ALUMINIUM CHLORIDE AT VARIOUS DOSES IN COAGULATION PROCESS ON COLOR REMOVAL OF PALM OIL MILL EFFLUENT" Based on the reviewers' recommendations, the manuscript has been **ACCEPTED** to be published in the JBAT Vol 11 No 2.

Best Regards

--

Dr. Megawati S.T., M.T.  
Editor in Chief  
Jurnal Bahan Alam Terbarukan (Journal of Biorefinery)

Department of Chemical Engineering, Engineering Faculty  
Semarang State University  
Gd. E1 Lt. 2 Kampus Sekaran, Gunungpati, Semarang 50229  
Telp/Fax: (024) 8508101 ext 114  
Email: [jurnal.bat@mail.unnes.ac.id](mailto:jurnal.bat@mail.unnes.ac.id)

Web Site: <http://journal.unnes.ac.id/nju/index.php/jbat>

---

**DISCLAIMER**

---

This electronic mail and/ or any files transmitted with it may contain confidential or copyright information of Universitas Negeri Semarang and/ or its Subsidiaries. If you are not an intended recipient, you must not keep, forward, copy, use, or rely on this electronic mail, and any such action is unauthorized and prohibited. If you have received this electronic mail in error, please reply to this electronic mail to notify the sender of its incorrect delivery, and then delete both it and your reply. Finally, you should check this electronic mail and any attachments for the presence of viruses. Universitas Negeri Semarang accepts no liability for any damages caused by any viruses transmitted by this electronic mail.

---