



Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>

[Water] Manuscript ID: water-994108 - Submission Received

1 pesan

Editorial Office <water@mdpi.com>

24 Oktober 2020 pukul 21.23

Balas Ke: water@mdpi.com

Kepada: Sarto Sarto <sarto@ugm.ac.id>

Cc: Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan <wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id>, Muslikhin Hidayat <mhidayat@ugm.ac.id>

Dear Dr. Sarto,

Thank you very much for uploading the following manuscript to the MDPI submission system. One of our editors will be in touch with you soon.

Journal name: Water

Manuscript ID: water-994108

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Effect of Current and Initial pH on Electrocoagulation in Treating the Distillery Spent Wash Having Very High Pollutant Content

Authors: Iqbal Syaichurrozi, Sarto Sarto *, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan, Muslikhin Hidayat

Received: 24 October 2020

E-mails: iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id, sarto@ugm.ac.id, wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id, mhidayat@ugm.ac.id

You can follow progress of your manuscript at the following link (login required):

https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/9220740a802356d3329ad9c2b4855dbe

The following points were confirmed during submission:

1. Water is an open access journal with publishing fees of 1800 CHF for an accepted paper (see <https://www.mdpi.com/about/apc/> for details). This manuscript, if accepted, will be published under an open access Creative Commons CC BY license (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>), and I agree to pay the Article Processing Charges as described on the journal webpage (<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/apc>). See <https://www.mdpi.com/about/openaccess> for more information about open access publishing.

Please note that you may be entitled to a discount if you have previously received a discount code or if your institute is participating in the MDPI Institutional Open Access Program (IOAP), for more information see <https://www.mdpi.com/about/ioap>. If you have been granted any other special discounts for your submission, please contact the Water editorial office.

2. I understand that:

a. If previously published material is reproduced in my manuscript, I will provide proof that I have obtained the necessary copyright permission. (Please refer to the Rights & Permissions website: <https://www.mdpi.com/authors/rights>).

b. My manuscript is submitted on the understanding that it has not been published in or submitted to another peer-reviewed journal. Exceptions to this rule are papers containing material disclosed at conferences. I confirm that I will inform the journal editorial office if this is the case for my manuscript. I confirm that all authors are familiar with and agree with submission of the contents of the manuscript. The journal editorial office

reserves the right to contact all authors to confirm this in case of doubt. I will provide email addresses for all authors and an institutional e-mail address for at least one of the co-authors, and specify the name, address and e-mail for invoicing purposes.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact the Water editorial office at water@mdpi.com

Kind regards,

Water Editorial Office
St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel, Switzerland
E-Mail: water@mdpi.com
Tel. +41 61 683 77 34
Fax: +41 61 302 89 18

*** This is an automatically generated email ***



Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>

[Water] Manuscript ID: water-994108 - Assistant Editor Assigned

1 pesan

Pichayapong Srisawad <srisawad@mdpi.com>

26 Oktober 2020 pukul 13.39

Balas Ke: srisawad@mdpi.com

Kepada: Sarto Sarto <sarto@ugm.ac.id>

Cc: Pichayapong Srisawad <srisawad@mdpi.com>, Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan <wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id>, Muslikhin Hidayat <mhidayat@ugm.ac.id>, Water Editorial Office <water@mdpi.com>

Dear Dr. Sarto,

Your manuscript has been assigned to Pichayapong Srisawad for further processing who will act as a point of contact for any questions related to your paper.

Journal: Water

Manuscript ID: water-994108

Title: Effect of Current and Initial pH on Electrocoagulation in Treating the Distillery Spent Wash Having Very High Pollutant Content

Authors: Iqbal Syaichurrozi , Sarto Sarto *, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan , Muslikhin Hidayat

Received: 24 October 2020

E-mails: iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id, sarto@ugm.ac.id, wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id, mhidayat@ugm.ac.id

You can find it here:

https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/9220740a802356d3329ad9c2b4855dbe

Best regards,

Mr. Pichayapong Srisawad, M. Eng.

Assistant Editor

Email: srisawad@mdpi.com

MDPI

Water Editorial Office

St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel,

Postfach, CH-4020 Basel,

Switzerland

E-Mail: water@mdpi.com

<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/>



Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>

[Water] Manuscript ID: water-994108 - Major Revisions

1 pesan

Water Editorial Office <water@mdpi.com>

25 November 2020 pukul 09.25

Balas Ke: srisawad@mdpi.com

Kepada: Sarto Sarto <sarto@ugm.ac.id>

Cc: Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan <wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id>, Muslikhin Hidayat <mhidayat@ugm.ac.id>, Water Editorial Office <water@mdpi.com>

Dear Dr. Sarto,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to Water:

Manuscript ID: water-994108

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Effect of Current and Initial pH on Electrocoagulation in Treating the Distillery Spent Wash Having Very High Pollutant Content

Authors: Iqbal Syaichurrozi, Sarto Sarto *, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan, Muslikhin Hidayat

Received: 24 October 2020

E-mails: iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id, sarto@ugm.ac.id, wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id, mhidayat@ugm.ac.id

Submitted to section: Wastewater Treatment and Reuse,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/sections/Wastewater_Treatment_Reuse

It has been reviewed by experts in the field and we request that you make major revisions before it is processed further. Please find your manuscript and the review reports at the following link:

<https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/resubmit/9220740a802356d3329ad9c2b4855dbe>

Your co-authors can also view this link if they have an account in our submission system using the e-mail address in this message.

Please revise the manuscript according to the reviewers' comments and upload the revised file within 10 days. Use the version of your manuscript found at the above link for your revisions, as the editorial office may have made formatting changes to your original submission. Any revisions should be clearly highlighted, for example using the "Track Changes" function in Microsoft Word, so that changes are easily visible to the editors and reviewers. Please provide a cover letter to explain point-by-point the details of the revisions in the manuscript and your responses to the reviewers' comments. Please include in your rebuttal if you found it impossible to address certain comments. The revised version will be inspected by the editors and reviewers. Please detail the revisions that have been made, citing the line number and exact change, so that the editor can check the changes expeditiously. Simple statements like 'done' or 'revised as requested' will not be accepted unless the change is simply a typographical error.

Please carefully read the guidelines outlined in the 'Instructions for Authors' on the journal website

<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/instructions> and ensure that your manuscript resubmission adheres to these guidelines. In particular, please ensure that abbreviations have been defined in parentheses the first time they appear in the abstract, main text, and in figure or table captions; citations within the text are in the correct format; references at the end of the text are in the correct format; figures and/or tables are placed at appropriate positions within the text and are of suitable quality; tables are prepared in MS Word table format, not as images; and permission has been

obtained and there are no copyright issues.

If the reviewers have suggested that your manuscript should undergo extensive English editing, please have the English in the manuscript thoroughly checked and edited for language and form. Alternatively, MDPI provides an English editing service checking grammar, spelling, punctuation and some improvement of style where necessary for an additional charge (extensive re-writing is not included), see details at <https://www.mdpi.com/authors/english>.

Do not hesitate to contact us if you have any questions regarding the revision of your manuscript or if you need more time. We look forward to hearing from you soon.

Kind regards,
Mr. Pichayapong Srisawad, M. Eng.
Assistant Editor
Email: srisawad@mdpi.com

MDPI
Water Editorial Office
St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel,
Postfach, CH-4020 Basel,
Switzerland
E-Mail: water@mdpi.com
<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/>

Reviewer 1

This manuscript is attempting to remove the COD from the distillery spent wash. This topic will attract a wide readership, and the results are reasonable. However, some minor concerns should be addressed before it is qualified for publication.

Reviewer comments	Author responses
A component analysis of the raw DSW should be given	Thank you. We have added the chemical characteristics of the raw DSW in Table 1. Line 146, Page 4.
Equation (3) and (6) are not consistent.	Thank you. We have added the detail calculation showing the two equations are consistent. Eq (3b) (Line 176, Page 5) with Eq (12a) (Line 198, Page 6)
The photos in Figure 5 and Figure 6 are not in good quality, and they can be transferred to drawings with trend lines.	Thank you. We have revised the figures. Please see figures 6 and 7. Line 371-373 (Page 14-15)
What are the coefficients of determination for the models? Some fittings seem not ideal. Will the models still fit when changing the pH?	Thank you. We have added calculation for the coefficient of determination. Eqs.19a-d (Line 213, Page 6-7). We proposed two models with different route. Explanation for the two model on Page 5-6 (Line 178-214). The R^2 for the model 1 and model 2 is shown in Table 3 (Line 314, Page 11) and Table 5 (Line 411, Page 17). For EC with variation of current, model 1 is suitable. However, model 2 is appropriate for initial pH of 5 and 7. Please check our explanation on Page 16.

Reviewer 2

General comment:

This work employs electrocoagulation (EC) to remove pollutants from distillery spent wash (DSW). The effect of the initial DSW pH and the current used during the EC experiments were analyzed by monitoring the effect of voltage, pH, electrolyte temperature, and volume and COD concentration for a period of 8 hours. A kinetic model in DSW's EC is proposed considering the collected data.

The paper has interesting results but presents too many English mistakes, insufficient scientific discussion, and inconsistent and hard-to-read sentences. Considering that, the reviewer suggests the rejection of the paper and, to the editor's discretion, a possible resubmission in the case the authors are able to significantly rewrite it and correct it.

Specific comments

Introduction

Reviewer comments	Author responses
Line 31: The word 'water' seems to be incorrectly used here. Please, correct to 'water'.	Thank you. We have revised it. Line 57
Which kind of pollutants exist in DSW composition? Please, mention some of the organic compounds.	Thank you. Please check Line 57-58. Then, chemical characteristics in our raw DSW are shown in Table 1 (Line 146)
The authors mention the low operating cost of the DSW's EC treatment but do not mention any other treatments available in the literature and their disadvantages compared to EC.	Thank you. Please check Line 59-72.
The authors discuss the use of Fe as an anode, but Al can also be employed in EC processes. Can Al also be used in DSW's EC? It should be discussed in the text.	Thank you. Please check Line 74-82.
The introduction does not have enough information about the topic and needs to be improved, namely by explaining other techniques used for DSW treatment and their issues or citing more works about DSW's EC.	Thank you. Please check Line 59-72 and 83-99.
There is a repetition of the tested different working conditions (Lines 51, 52, and 56, 57).	Thank you. For Line 56-57, we have deleted it. Please check Line 121.

No information about the kinetic model and its development is given. Just at the end of the introduction the reader is informed about this part of the work and seems to be out of context.	Thank you. Please check Line 112-120.
---	---------------------------------------

Materials and methods

Reviewer comments	Author responses
Line 62: The initial conductivity of the electrolyte should be given in the text. Conductivity is not one of the parameters recorded during the work. Conductivity values should be mentioned to give an idea on the electrolyte conductivity to check if it could be an issue.	Thank you. We have added information about chemical characteristics (including conductivity) in our raw DSW that are shown in Table 1 (Line 146, Page 4)
Line 67: The distance between the electrodes seems to be significant (5.5 cm). It is essential to know the solution conductivity to understand how the ohmic resistance will influence this electrolyte's electrochemical behavior at the beginning of the electrolysis when there are no metal ions in solution.	Thank you. We have added information about the conductivity of the raw DSW in Table 1 (Line 146, Page 4)

Development of Kinetic Model

Reviewer comments	Author responses
There is a section for the kinetic model and equations employed in its application but part of that information should be moved to the introduction and some to results and discussion.	Thank you. We have added information about the models in Introduction (Line 112-120)

Results and discussion

Reviewer comments	Author responses
The topic is interesting and the results could be useful, but they are not properly organized or presented in the most appealing form. The discussion is confusing and difficult to follow. The authors should present deeper discussion and a better comparison with the literature.	Thank you. We have added deep discussions. Furthermore, we have proposed two models with two different routes. Moreover, the comparison between this study and other studies has discussed in point 4.3 (Line 420-437).

Figure 7 needs to be changed because it is not readable at all – the curves overlap the legends.	Thank you. We have revised it. Please check Figure 3 (line 294, page 10).
The results and discussion of the modeling are difficult to follow, as previously mentioned.	Thank you. We have revised it. Please check line 300-312 and line 375-410.
Line 235: “thesolution” – please, correct it.	Thank you. We have revised it. Line 451.

Reviewer 3

Overall, a grammar check is required. In many sentences, definite (the) or indefinite (a or an) articles are omitted.

Reviewer comments	Author responses
17 : resulted higher ; resulted in higher	Thank you. We have revised it. Line 18.
152 : easy ; easily	Thank you. We have revised it. Line 283.
153 : Figure2(C) ; Figure 2(C)	Thank you. We have revised it. Line 290.
184 : brought ; brought	Thank you. We have revised it. Line 339.
194 : Surprisingly's expression is inappropriate in academic papers. It would be nice to change it to the word 'remarkably'.	Thank you. We have revised it. Line 349.
209 : more ; higher	Thank you. We have revised it. Line 364.
228 : was resulted ; produced or generated	Thank you. We have revised it. Line 312.
235 : thesolution ; the solution	Thank you. We have revised it. Line 451.
237 : until end of process ; until the end of the process	Thank you. We have revised it to become "throughout the process". Line 452
239 : and flotation processes. ; and flotation reaction.	Thank you. We have revised it. Line 454
240 : produced ; produced	Thank you. We have revised it. Line 454.
241 : As consequent ; As consequence	Thank you. We have revised it. Line 456-457.
In the Equation (7), the font size of the left side is small to compare to the right side. It will be better to correct the font.	Thank you. We have check it (now Eq (11)) (Page 5). The left and right sides use the cambria math size 10.
Figure 5 and 6 Due to the background of the Figure 5 and 6, the results of the change are hard to see and check. The backgrounds of all pictures in Figure 5 and 6 should be unified in white so that changes in the sample can be distinguished well. Rather than holding the sample with hand and taking a picture, you should fix it with a conical tube rack and replace it with a picture taken. A picture should be taken so that the scale of the conical tube can be checked.	Thank you. We have revised the figures to become figures 6-7. Check the figures on Page 14-15, Line 371-373 .

Reviewer 4

Figure 7

The font size of the legend is large, so it overlaps the graph. It is desirable to make the font size smaller so that the trend of the graph can be seen clearly.

Response:

Thank you. We have revised the figure. Please check the Figure 3 (Line 294, page 10)

In the attached file you will find a miner notes to improve your paper

[peer-review-9461824.v1.pdf](#)

Reviewer comments	Author comments
14. investigated	14. is to investigate
31. waster bodies	57. water bodies
43. mg/L	95. mgL ⁻¹
46-47. The dilution before EC treatment is not interesting because it will make the total volume of the DSW to be very much more.	98-99. Dilution prior to the EC treatment is not attractive because it will make up the total volume of DSW more.
138. Many authors believed that the working volume is constant.	263-264. Many authors believed that the working volume is constant [16-18].
In Figure 1 (D-F), omit "decrease in"	We have revised in. Please check Figure 1 (D-F) on Page 8

Reviewer 5

Manuscript ID: Water-994108

Title: Effect of Current and Initial pH on Electrocoagulation in Treating the Distillery Spent Wash Having Very High Pollutant Content

This paper deals with the treatment of distillery spent wash (DSW) by means of electrocoagulation (EC). In this sense, the effect of initial pH (acid and neutral) and current (2.5, 3 and 3.5 A) were studied. Besides, a kinetic model was also developed based on the formation of sludge from COD and scum from sludge. However, this reviewer has serious concerns about the novelty of this study, because the authors recently published other work focused on the treatment of DSW by means of EC. Besides, this reviewer has also some concerns about the modeling. Therefore, I do not recommend its publication in *Water* in the present form. In this sense, the changes required are included in the attached pdf.

[peer-review-9461996.v1.pdf](#)

Reviewer comments	Author comments
14. investigated	14. is to investigate
17. resulted	18. resulted in
18. temperature increased from beginning until end of process	19. temperature increased throughout the process
22-23. The kinetic constant of k_a and k_b for current of 3.5 A was higher than that for current of 2.5 and 3 A	27-28. The higher the current was applied in the EC, the higher the kinetic constants of k_a and k_b would be.
In my opinion, introduction must be improved. Nothing is commented about other methodologies to remove high polluting streams as DSW. Besides, there is no information related to the use of Fe as anode.	Please check Line 59-82.
30. bioetanol	56. bioethanol
31. is forbidden to be thrown away	57. cannot be released
33-34. Furthermore, it results hydrogen gas that can be stored and used as an energy source	69-70. Furthermore, hydrogen gas, an alternative energy, could also be obtained during the EC process
35. the coagulants are resulted with help of electrical force	73. the coagulants resulted from the help of electrical force
39. resulted	78. resulted in
For Line 41-43, Could you please indicate which parameters were analysed in these studies? Are the same as those studied in the current work?	We have added the information about those. Please check Line 83-99.
What is the novelty of this study in comparison to the previous ones? Is the use of undiluted DSW? Please clearly state it. On the other hand, what is the novelty of	The novelty of this study is (1) without dilution (Line 101), (2) using the constant current during 8 h which is different from our previous study (Line 101-108), (3)

<p>this study in comparison to your previous one (reference 6)?</p>	<p>development of the simple mechanistic models (line 112-120).</p>
<p>57. in</p>	<p>124. at</p>
<p>61. bioetanol</p>	<p>129. bioethanol</p>
<p>More details about the DSW should be provided because they can also influence the EC treatment. For example, the conductivity, alkalinity, concentration of salts (P, K, N...)</p>	<p>Thank you. The chemical characteristics in our raw DSW are shown in Table 1 (Line 146). The explanation about that in Line 129-144.</p>
<p>67-68. same with that</p>	<p>152. the same used</p>
<p>69. of</p>	<p>154. at</p>
<p>72. aquadest</p>	<p>157. distilled water</p>
<p>79. was</p>	<p>164. were</p>
<p>87. adsorbtion</p>	<p>172. adsorption</p>
<p>124. "These results were in line with studies of [13-14] " Please give some details about the studies used for comparison purposes.</p>	<p>238-243. These results were in line with some studies [26-27] where the solution pH usually increases during the EC process. Kobya et al. [26] reported that the final pH is always higher than the initial pH (3, 5, 7, 9, 11) in EC using iron electrode in treating textile wastewaters. Meanwhile, Kim et al. [27] also found the same conclusion that the solution pH increased at the end of the process at the initial pH of 3, 5, 7, 9 in the EC in treating the groundwater.</p>
<p>157. Could you please include the operating conditions on the Figure caption.? I mean Initial COD, initial pH and initial temperature?</p>	<p>Thank you. Please check the title of the figure 1 (251-253)</p>
<p>220. "very low SSE value" Although low SSE value was obtained. The model when 3.5 A were used significantly differs from the experimental data, specially in the case of sludge and scum. Please revise it.</p>	<p>Thank you. We have revised it. Please check Line 301-312.</p>
<p>222. "/h" It is commonly expressed as h-1. Please change it.</p>	<p>306. h⁻¹</p>
<p>233. resulted</p>	<p>447. resulted in</p>
<p>234-235. "Furthermore, initial pH of 7 could decrease more COD mass than initial pH 4.4 and 5."</p>	<p>448-450. Furthermore, the EC with the initial pH of 7 could decrease more COD mass than that with the initial pHs of 4.4 and 5.0.</p>

237. until end of process	452. throughout the process
240-241. . Variable of initial pH of 7.0 had no supernatant (sludge all) at the processing time above 5 h.	455-456. When initial pH of 7.0 was used, for times higher than 5 h, supernatant was not observed, just obtaining sludge
241. consequent	457. consequence
249. Could you please remove the legend from the figure and include it in the figure caption? It is difficult to see the data and models.	<p>Thank you. Please check the title of Figure 3 in Line 294-298.</p> <p>“Figure 3. Comparison between experimental data and predicted data obtained by the mechanistic models: (A) COD, (B) sludge, (C) scum. (◊, 2.5 A experimental data; ◻, 3 A experimental data; Δ, 3.5 A experimental data), (black line-square dot, 2.5 A model 1; black line-solid, 3 A model 1; black line-long dash, 3.5 A model 1), (red line-square dot, 2.5 A model 2; red line-solid, 3 A model 2; red line-long dash, 3.5 A model 2).</p>



Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>

[Water] Manuscript ID: water-994108 - Manuscript Resubmitted

1 pesan

Submission System <submission@mdpi.com>

4 Desember 2020 pukul 21.26

Balas Ke: Pichayapong Srisawad <srisawad@mdpi.com>, Water Editorial Office <water@mdpi.com>

Kepada: Sarto Sarto <sarto@ugm.ac.id>

Cc: Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan <wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id>, Muslikhin Hidayat <mhidayat@ugm.ac.id>

Dear Dr. Sarto,

Thank you very much for resubmitting the modified version of the following manuscript:

Manuscript ID: water-994108

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Effect of Current and Initial pH on Electrocoagulation in Treating the Distillery Spent Wash Having Very High Pollutant Content

Authors: Iqbal Syaichurrozi, Sarto Sarto *, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan, Muslikhin Hidayat

Received: 24 October 2020

E-mails: iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id, sarto@ugm.ac.id,

wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id, mhidayat@ugm.ac.id

Submitted to section: Wastewater Treatment and Reuse,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/sections/Wastewater_Treatment_Reuse

https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/9220740a802356d3329ad9c2b4855dbe

A member of the editorial office will be in touch with you soon regarding progress of the manuscript.

Kind regards,

MDPI

--

Water Editorial Office

Postfach, CH-4020 Basel, Switzerland

Office: St. Alban-Anlage 66, CH-4052 Basel

Tel. +41 61 683 77 34 (office)

Fax +41 61 302 89 18 (office)

E-mail: water@mdpi.com

<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/>

*** This is an automatically generated email ***



Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>

[Water] Manuscript ID: water-994108 - Revised Version Received

1 pesan

Water Editorial Office <water@mdpi.com>

5 Desember 2020 pukul 10.51

Balas Ke: sissi.jia@mdpi.comKepada: Sarto Sarto <sarto@ugm.ac.id>Cc: Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan <wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id>, Muslikhin Hidayat <mhidayat@ugm.ac.id>, Water Editorial Office <water@mdpi.com>

Dear Dr. Sarto,

Thank you very much for providing the revised version of your paper:

Manuscript ID: water-994108

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Effect of Current and Initial pH on Electrocoagulation in Treating the Distillery Spent Wash Having Very High Pollutant Content

Authors: Iqbal Syaichurrozi, Sarto Sarto *, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan, Muslikhin Hidayat

Received: 24 October 2020

E-mails: iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id, sarto@ugm.ac.id, wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id, mhidayat@ugm.ac.id

Submitted to section: Wastewater Treatment and Reuse,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/sections/Wastewater_Treatment_Reusehttps://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/9220740a802356d3329ad9c2b4855dbe

We will continue processing your paper and will keep you informed about the submission status.

Kind regards,

Ms. Sissi Jia

E-Mail: sissi.jia@mdpi.com

--

MDPI Tianjin Office 170 North Road, Room 1804, Block A, Lujiazui Financial Plaza, Hongqiao District, China

MDPI Water Editorial Office

St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel, Switzerland

E-Mail: water@mdpi.com<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/water>



Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>

[Water] Manuscript ID: water-994108 - Minor Revisions

1 pesan

Water Editorial Office <water@mdpi.com>

11 Desember 2020 pukul 16.40

Balas Ke: srisawad@mdpi.com

Kepada: Sarto Sarto <sarto@ugm.ac.id>

Cc: Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan <wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id>, Muslikhin Hidayat <mhidayat@ugm.ac.id>, Water Editorial Office <water@mdpi.com>

Dear Dr. Sarto,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript:

Manuscript ID: water-994108

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Effect of Current and Initial pH on Electrocoagulation in Treating the Distillery Spent Wash Having Very High Pollutant Content

Authors: Iqbal Syaichurrozi, Sarto Sarto *, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan, Muslikhin Hidayat

Received: 24 October 2020

E-mails: iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id, sarto@ugm.ac.id, wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id, mhidayat@ugm.ac.id

Submitted to section: Wastewater Treatment and Reuse,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/sections/Wastewater_Treatment_Reuse

It has been reviewed by experts in the field and we request that you make minor revisions before it is processed further. Please find your manuscript and the review reports at the following link:

<https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/resubmit/9220740a802356d3329ad9c2b4855dbe>

Your co-authors can also view this link if they have an account in our submission system using the e-mail address in this message.

Please revise the manuscript according to the reviewers' comments and upload the revised file within 2 days. Use the version of your manuscript found at the above link for your revisions, as the editorial office may have made formatting changes to your original submission. Any revisions should be clearly highlighted, for example using the "Track Changes" function in Microsoft Word, so that they are easily visible to the editors and reviewers. Please provide a short cover letter detailing any changes, for the benefit of the editors and reviewers. Please detail the revisions that have been made, citing the line number and exact change, so that the editor can check the changes expeditiously. Simple statements like 'done' or 'revised as requested' will not be accepted unless the change is simply a typographical error.

If the reviewers have suggested that your manuscript should undergo extensive English editing, please have the English in the manuscript thoroughly checked and edited for language and form. Alternatively, MDPI provides an English editing service checking grammar, spelling, punctuation and some improvement of style where necessary for an additional charge (extensive re-writing is not included), see details at <https://www.mdpi.com/authors/english>.

Do not hesitate to contact us if you have any questions regarding the revision of your manuscript or if you need more time. We look forward to hearing from you soon.

Kind regards,

Mr. Pichayapong Srisawad, M. Eng.

Assistant Editor

Email: srisawad@mdpi.com

MDPI

Water Editorial Office

St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel,

Postfach, CH-4020 Basel,

Switzerland

E-Mail: water@mdpi.com

<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/>

Reviewer 2

The authors took into consideration the reviewers' comments and managed to significantly improve the quality of the paper. The addition of literature data in the introduction and the extended discussion show the effort they have made. The newly added parts are generally good but need some language polishing. The reviewer recommends the manuscript acceptance after minor corrections detailed below.

Reviewer remarks:

- Lines 132, 133: "If the DSW is released directly to the water bodies, the water biota cannot breathe and finally death" - please, change the phrase to "If the DSW is released directly to the water bodies, the water biota can die due to the high COD values in the water."

Response:

Thank you. We have revised the sentence. Please check Line 131-132.

- Line 138: The definition of alkalinity is really not needed. The phrase "The alkalinity is a function of pH. At low pH, the alkalinity is very low or not detected" should be removed.

Response:

Thank you. We have removed the sentence. Please check Line 137-138.

- Line 142: "It cannot be used as a fertilizer because the soil structure will be poor (not fertility)" - This needs to be better explained. It is not obvious to the reader why the wastewater with high organic content cannot be used as fertilizer. Could you please add a short sentence explaining it?

Response:

Thank you. We have revised and added a short sentence. Please check Line 140-142

- Except for the case of model 2 and $\text{pH} = 4.4$, all other R_2 values are lower than 0.98. In a short sentence, the authors should mention that there is a considerable deviation in the other cases.

Response:

Thank you. We have added sentences. Please check Line 408-410.

- Some English mistakes throughout the manuscript should be corrected before publication.

Response:

Thank you. We have revised some words in the manuscript.

Lines 29, 30, 77, 87, 90, 108, 151, 158, 159, 167, 227, 241, 243, 258, 284, 309, 310, 333, 336, 352, 353, 382, 385, 419,

- The reviewer suggests putting the letters (A), (B), etc., inside the figures and not outside, as it facilitates the reader's understanding.

Response:

Thank you. We have revised the figures. Please check Figure 1 (page 8), Figure 2 (page 9), Figure 3 (page 10), Figure 4 (page 12), Figure 5 (page 13), Figure 8 (page 17),

- Line 81, “89.941 and 95.045%”, these percentages should not have more than one decimal place. Change it to “89.9 and 95.0%”. This should also be corrected in the abstract and checked throughout the paper.

Response:

Thank you. We have revised them. Please check Lines 17, 80, 84, 272, 273, 358, 448 and in Table 6 (page 19)

- In table 6, the first column is meaningless and should be removed.

Response:

Thank you. We have removed the first column. Please check Table 6 (page 19)

Reviewer 3

It is judged that the content has been improved more than the previous version of the paper, and the English expression including grammar has been improved. The relationship between the changes in sludge and scum and COD has been well established, and the contents of the modeling based on this paper are sufficiently interesting.

Response: Thank you.

Reviewer 5

This paper deals with the treatment of distillery spent wash (DSW) by means of electrocoagulation (EC). In this sense, the effect of initial pH (acid and neutral) and current (2.5, 3 and 3.5 A) were studied. Besides, a kinetic model was also developed based on the formation of sludge from COD and scum from sludge. The authors has considered all my comments carefully. Therefore, I recommend its publication in *Water*.

Response: Thank you.



Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>

[Water] Manuscript ID: water-994108 - Manuscript Resubmitted

1 pesan

Submission System <submission@mdpi.com>

13 Desember 2020 pukul 16.07

Balas Ke: Pichayapong Srisawad <srisawad@mdpi.com>, Water Editorial Office <water@mdpi.com>

Kepada: Sarto Sarto <sarto@ugm.ac.id>

Cc: Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan <wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id>, Muslikhin Hidayat <mhidayat@ugm.ac.id>

Dear Dr. Sarto,

Thank you very much for resubmitting the modified version of the following manuscript:

Manuscript ID: water-994108

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Effect of Current and Initial pH on Electrocoagulation in Treating the Distillery Spent Wash Having Very High Pollutant Content

Authors: Iqbal Syaichurrozi, Sarto Sarto *, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan, Muslikhin Hidayat

Received: 24 October 2020

E-mails: iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id, sarto@ugm.ac.id,

wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id, mhidayat@ugm.ac.id

Submitted to section: Wastewater Treatment and Reuse,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/sections/Wastewater_Treatment_Reuse

https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/9220740a802356d3329ad9c2b4855dbe

A member of the editorial office will be in touch with you soon regarding progress of the manuscript.

Kind regards,

MDPI

--

Water Editorial Office

Postfach, CH-4020 Basel, Switzerland

Office: St. Alban-Anlage 66, CH-4052 Basel

Tel. +41 61 683 77 34 (office)

Fax +41 61 302 89 18 (office)

E-mail: water@mdpi.com

<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/>

*** This is an automatically generated email ***



Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>

[Water] Manuscript ID: water-994108 - Revised Version Received

1 pesan

Water Editorial Office <water@mdpi.com>

13 Desember 2020 pukul 18.12

Balas Ke: srisawad@mdpi.com

Kepada: Sarto Sarto <sarto@ugm.ac.id>

Cc: Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan <wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id>, Muslikhin Hidayat <mhidayat@ugm.ac.id>, Water Editorial Office <water@mdpi.com>

Dear Dr. Sarto,

Thank you very much for providing the revised version of your paper:

Manuscript ID: water-994108

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Effect of Current and Initial pH on Electrocoagulation in Treating the Distillery Spent Wash Having Very High Pollutant Content

Authors: Iqbal Syaichurrozi, Sarto Sarto *, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan, Muslikhin Hidayat

Received: 24 October 2020

E-mails: iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id, sarto@ugm.ac.id, wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id, mhidayat@ugm.ac.id

Submitted to section: Wastewater Treatment and Reuse,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/sections/Wastewater_Treatment_Reuse

https://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/9220740a802356d3329ad9c2b4855dbe

We will continue processing your paper and will keep you informed about the submission status.

Kind regards,

Mr. Pichayapong Srisawad, M. Eng.

Assistant Editor

Email: srisawad@mdpi.com

MDPI

Water Editorial Office

St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel,

Postfach, CH-4020 Basel,

Switzerland

E-Mail: water@mdpi.com

<http://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/>



Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>

[Water] Manuscript ID: water-994108 - Accepted for Publication

1 pesan

Water Editorial Office <water@mdpi.com>

16 Desember 2020 pukul 19.11

Balas Ke: Water Editorial Office <water@mdpi.com>

Kepada: Sarto Sarto <sarto@ugm.ac.id>

Cc: Iqbal Syaichurrozi <iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id>, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan <wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id>, Muslikhin Hidayat <mhidayat@ugm.ac.id>, Water Editorial Office <water@mdpi.com>

Dear Dr. Sarto,

We are pleased to inform you that the following paper has been officially accepted for publication:

Manuscript ID: water-994108

Type of manuscript: Article

Title: Effect of Current and Initial pH on Electrocoagulation in Treating the Distillery Spent Wash Having Very High Pollutant Content

Authors: Iqbal Syaichurrozi, Sarto Sarto *, Wahyudi Budi Sediawan, Muslikhin Hidayat

Received: 24 October 2020

E-mails: iqbal_syaichurrozi@untirta.ac.id, sarto@ugm.ac.id, wbsediawan@ugm.ac.id, mhidayat@ugm.ac.id

Submitted to section: Wastewater Treatment and Reuse,

https://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/sections/Wastewater_Treatment_Reusehttps://susy.mdpi.com/user/manuscripts/review_info/9220740a802356d3329ad9c2b4855dbe

We will now make the final preparations for publication, then return the manuscript to you for your approval.

If, however, extensive English edits are required to your manuscript, we will need to return the paper requesting improvements throughout.

We encourage you to set up your profile at SciProfiles.com, MDPI's researcher network platform. Articles you publish with MDPI will be linked to your SciProfiles page, where colleagues and peers will be able to see all of your publications, citations, as well as your other academic contributions.

We also invite you to contribute to Encyclopedia (<https://encyclopedia.pub>), a scholarly platform providing accurate information about the latest research results. You can adapt parts of your paper to provide valuable reference information for others in the field.

Kind regards,

Ms. Fionna Fu

Skype: live:fionna.fu

Twitter: @fuxianfang

Assistant Editor

We invite you to follow us on Twitter @Water_MDPI

Three Awards in Water: 2021 Young Investigator Award, 2021 Travel Award and 2021 Best Paper Award are now available for your application. Please check details at: <https://www.mdpi.com/journal/water/awards>

Water/MDPI (<https://www.mdpi.com/journal/water>, IF 2.544) will attend AGU2020 as a supporter. Please visit our online booth at:

<https://s23.a2zinc.net/clients/corcexpo/agu2020/Public/eBooth.aspx?IndexInList=35&FromPage=Exhibitors.aspx&ParentBoothID=&ListByBooth=true&BoothID=182313>

MDPI

Water Editorial Office

St. Alban-Anlage 66, 4052 Basel, Switzerland

E-mail: water@mdpi.com