



iqbal syaichurrozi <iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com>

A manuscript number has been assigned: EGY-D-19-04622

1 message

Energy <eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com>

Wed, Jul 3, 2019 at 9:05 AM

Reply-To: Energy <energy@elsevier.com>

To: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

Cc: fakhri160496@yahoo.com, rusdi.rachman@ymail.com, rafimuhammadf15@gmail.com

*** Automated email sent by the system ***

A Preliminary Study: Effect of Initial pH and Saccharomyces cerevisiae Addition on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta* and Kinetics

Article Type: Full length article

EGY-D-19-04622

Dear Dr. syaichurrozi:

Your submission with the above title has been assigned the following manuscript number: EGY-D-19-04622.

You may check on the progress of your paper by logging on to the Elsevier Editorial System as an author using the following details:

URL: <https://ees.elsevier.com/egy/>Your username is: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

If you need to retrieve password details, please go to:

http://ees.elsevier.com/egy/automail_query.as

Thank you for your interest in ENERGY.

Sincerely,
ENERGY

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923> Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EES via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.



iqbal syaichurrozi <iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com>

Your Submission EGY-D-19-04622

1 message

Energy <eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com>

Sat, Sep 14, 2019 at 3:34 AM

Reply-To: Energy <energy@elsevier.com>

To: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

Cc: rafimuhammadf15@gmail.com, rusdi.rachman@gmail.com, fakhri160496@yahoo.com

Ms. Ref. No.: EGY-D-19-04622

Title: A Preliminary Study: Effect of Initial pH and Saccharomyces cerevisiae Addition on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta* and Kinetics

Energy

Dear Mr. syaichurrozi,

The review of your paper is now complete, the Reviewers' reports are below. As you can see, one Reviewer recommends rejection, and the others recommend possible reconsideration after major revisions. They have presented important points of criticism and a series of recommendations. We kindly ask you to consider all comments and revise the paper accordingly in order to respond fully and in detail to the Reviewers' recommendations. If this process is completed thoroughly, the paper will be acceptable for a second review.

If you choose to revise your manuscript it will be due into the Editorial Office by the Dec 12, 2019

Once you have revised the paper accordingly, please submit it together with a detailed description of your response to these comments. Please, also include a separate copy of the revised paper in which you have marked the revisions made.

Please note if a reviewer suggests you to cite specific literature, you should only do so if you feel the literature is relevant and will improve your paper. Otherwise please ignore such suggestions and indicate this fact to the handling editor in your rebuttal.

To submit a revision, please go to <https://ees.elsevier.com/egy/> and login as an Author.

Your username is: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

If you need to retrieve password details, please go to: http://ees.elsevier.com/egy/automail_query.asp.

NOTE: Upon submitting your revised manuscript, please upload the source files for your article. For additional details regarding acceptable file formats, please refer to the Guide for Authors at: <http://www.elsevier.com/journals/energy/0360-5442/guide-for-authors>

When submitting your revised paper, we ask that you include the following items:

Manuscript and Figure Source Files (mandatory):

We cannot accommodate PDF manuscript files for production purposes. We also ask that when submitting your revision you follow the journal formatting guidelines. Figures and tables may be embedded within the source file for the submission as long as they are of sufficient resolution for Production. For any figure that cannot be embedded within the source file (such as *.PSD Photoshop files), the original figure needs to be uploaded separately. Refer to the Guide for Authors for additional information.

<http://www.elsevier.com/journals/energy/0360-5442/guide-for-authors>

Highlights (mandatory):

Highlights consist of a short collection of bullet points that convey the core findings of the article and should be submitted in a separate file in the online submission system. Please use 'Highlights' in the file name and include 3 to 5 bullet points (maximum 85 characters, including spaces, per bullet point). See the following website for more information

<http://www.elsevier.com/highlights>

In order to give our readers a sense of continuity and since editorial procedure often takes time, we encourage you to update your reference list by conducting an up-to-date literature search as part of your revision.

On your Main Menu page, you will find a folder entitled "Submissions Needing Revision". Your submission record will be presented here.

MethodsX file (optional)

If you have customized (a) research method(s) for the project presented in your Energy article, you are invited to submit this part of your work as MethodsX article alongside your revised research article. MethodsX is an independent journal that publishes the work you have done to develop research methods to your specific needs or setting. This is an opportunity to get full credit for the time and money you may have spent on developing research methods, and to increase the visibility and impact of your work.

How does it work?

- 1) Fill in the MethodsX article template: <https://www.elsevier.com/MethodsX-template>
- 2) Place all MethodsX files (including graphical abstract, figures and other relevant files) into a .zip file and upload this as a 'Method Details (MethodsX)' item alongside your revised Energy manuscript. Please ensure all of your relevant MethodsX documents are zipped into a single file.
- 3) If your Energy research article is accepted, your MethodsX article will automatically be transferred to MethodsX, where it will be reviewed and published as a separate article upon acceptance. MethodsX is a fully Open Access journal, the publication fee is only 520 US\$.

Questions? Please contact the MethodsX team at methodsx@elsevier.com. Example MethodsX articles can be found here: <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/journal/22150161>

Include interactive data visualizations in your publication and let your readers interact and engage more closely with your research. Follow the instructions here: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors/author-services/data-visualization> to find out about available data visualization options and how to include them with your article.

MethodsX file (optional)

We invite you to submit a method article alongside your research article. This is an opportunity to get full credit for the time and money you have spent on developing research methods, and to increase the visibility and impact of your work. If your research article is accepted, your method article will be automatically transferred over to the open access journal, MethodsX, where it will be editorially reviewed and published as a separate method article upon acceptance. Both articles will be linked on ScienceDirect. Please use the MethodsX template available here when preparing your article: <https://www.elsevier.com/MethodsX-template>. Open access fees apply.

Thank you very much for expressing your interest in ENERGY.

Sincerely,

Silvia Azucena Azucena Nebra, Dr.
Subject Editor
Energy
Data in Brief (optional):

We invite you to convert your supplementary data (or a part of it) into an additional journal publication in Data in Brief, a multi-disciplinary open access journal. Data in Brief articles are a fantastic way to describe supplementary data and associated metadata, or full raw datasets deposited in an external repository, which are otherwise unnoticed. A Data in Brief article (which will be reviewed, formatted, indexed, and given a DOI) will make your data easier to find, reproduce, and cite.

You can submit to Data in Brief via the Energy submission system when you upload your revised Energy manuscript. To do so, complete the template and follow the co-submission instructions found here: www.elsevier.com/dib-template. If your Energy manuscript is accepted, your Data in Brief submission will automatically be transferred to Data in Brief for editorial review and publication.

Please note: an open access Article Publication Charge (APC) is payable by the author or research funder to cover the costs associated with publication in Data in Brief and ensure your data article is immediately and permanently free to

access by all. For the current APC see: www.elsevier.com/journals/data-in-brief/2352-3409/open-access-journal

Please contact the Data in Brief editorial office at dib-me@elsevier.com or visit the Data in Brief homepage (www.journals.elsevier.com/data-in-brief/) if you have questions or need further information.

Note: While submitting the revised manuscript, please double check the author names provided in the submission so that authorship related changes are made in the revision stage. If your manuscript is accepted, any authorship change will involve approval from co-authors and respective editor handling the submission and this may cause a significant delay in publishing your manuscript.

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #1: -In introduction, Line50, "In addition, the methane content in biogas from DR5-DR8 (72.51-84.98%) was higher than that from D5-D8 (6.60-75.03%)." The content of methane in D5-D8 was only 6.60%? Please check it carefully.
 -Microbial mechanism analysis was not carried out in this study.
 -How to determine the existence of *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* during the AD process for 30 days?
 -Generally, the lignocellulosic plants were not very easy to be degraded, the addition of SC could enhance the degradation of lignocellulosic plants? More references should be cited to explain this.
 -Lack of novelty did in this research.

Reviewer #2: This work involved to reveal the effect of *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* addition on anaerobic performance of *Salvinia molesta*, and explore the optimal pH value. The authors used three modes (e.g. modified Gompertz, Cone and first order kinetic mode) to evaluate the fitting level. The topic is practical and interesting, but some need improve. Hence, major revision is necessary. Some special comments are shown as bellows:

1. The introduction should review the SC in biogas production.
2. In this work, some statements should discuss in detail, such as the correlation between pH variation and the change of VFA and TAN. It is necessary to draw a definite conclusion.
3. The pH 7 and 8 without SC accelerate to biogas production. Please explain it.
4. Fig.5-7 should be showed in Supplementary Material due to their insignificance
5. Avoid rough layout and typos:
 - (1) The conjunction, and, such as the title of Section 2.1, it should be written "*Salvinia molesta*, Inoculum and *Saccharomyces cerevisiae*"
 - (2) Keep a unique form for unit or significant figure
 - (3) Revise the reference style according to the documents (Guide for Author), page2,line50

Reviewer #3: the paper is an interesting valuable hot topic for energy and environment problems. how to improve biogas production, many scientists all would have been done much works, "Effect of Initial pH and *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* Addition on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta* and Kinetics" is belong to one.

the experimental Design of the paper is scientific, data analysis is also reasonable, but some-mistakes are needed to be modified.

- 1、"600-mL-polyethylene bottles as lab-scale anaerobic batch digesters" , a schematic diagram of the experimental device needs to be added;
- 2、SM as much as 10 g was put into the digesters. Water was added with ratio of SM/water of 1/13 (w/v). What is the basis for determining the quantity on SM and ratio of SM/water ;
- 3、discuss is lack in paper.
- 4、The number of literature is insufficient and many important literatures are not cited. for examples: Mao, Chunlan. Linkage of kinetic parameters with process parameters and operational conditions during anaerobic digestion. ENERGY.DI 10.1016/j.energy.2017.06.050

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923> Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EES via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of

our customer support representatives.

Reviewer #1:

-In introduction, Line50, "In addition, the methane content in biogas from DR5-DR8 (72.51-84.98%) was higher than that from D5-D8 (6.60-75.03%)." The content of methane in D5-D8 was only 6.60%? Please check it carefully.

Response:

Thank you. Please check our explanation on the revised manuscript (page 7 and 11)

On page 7

The D5 resulted the lowest methane content (6.60%). In other words, biogas from D5 contained much more by-products (especially CO₂) than methane. It was correlated with the adaptation of methanogenic bacteria in the environment. The initial pH of 5 was not good for the bacterial activity.

On page 11

Methane content in DR5 (72.51%) was higher than that in D5 (6.60%). It showed that methanogenic bacteria still could produce methane at initial pH of 5 if their nutrients were available in the system. By SC presence, the main nutrients (such as glucose, VFAs, TAN, etc) for methanogenic bacteria were more abundant than in no SC addition case. However, biogas yield in DR5 was lower than the others (DR6-DR8).

-Microbial mechanism analysis was not carried out in this study.

Response:

Thank you. We have added analysis to measure microbial cell during AD process. Please check point 2.4 and point 3.3.

-How to determine the existence of *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* during the AD process for 30 days?

Response:

Thank you. Please check point 3.3, Fig.6 and Fig.7.

-Generally, the lignocellulosic plants were not very easy to be degraded, the addition of SC

could enhance the degradation of lignocellulosic plants? More references should be cited to explain this.

Response:

Thank you. Please check our explanation on page 3.

-Lack of novelty did in this research.

Response:

Thank you. We have added Table 1 to show that this research was new. Some addition explanations about the phenomena VFAs and TAN during AD have been shown on page 9, 10 and 12.

Reviewer #2: This work involved to reveal the effect of *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* addition on anaerobic performance of *Salviniamolesta*, and explore the optimal pH value. The authors used three modes (e.g. modified Gompertz, Cone and first order kinetic mode) to evaluate the fitting level. The topic is practical and interesting, but some need improve. Hence, major revision is necessary. Some special comments are shown as bellows:

1. The introduction should review the SC in biogas production.

Response:

Thank you. Please check page 3 and Table 1.

2. In this work, some statements should discuss in detail, such as the correlation between pH variation and the change of VFA and TAN. It is necessary to draw a definite conclusion.

Response:

Thank you. Please check page 9 and 12.

3. The pH 7 and 8 without SC accelerate to biogas production. Please explain it.

Response:

Thank you. Please check page 9 and 10.

4. Fig.5-7 should be showed in Supplementary Material due to their insignificance

Response:

Thank you. We have replaced them in Supplementary Material

5. Avoid rough layout and typos:

(1) The conjunction, and, such as the title of Section 2.1, it should be written "Salviniamolesta, Inoculum and Saccharomyces cerevisiae"

Response:

Thank you. We have revised them

(2) Keep a unique form for unit or significant figure

Response:

Thank you. Please check our revision on the manuscript

(3) Revise the reference style according to the documents (Guide for Author), page2,line50

Response:

Thank you. Please check our revision on the manuscript

Reviewer #3: the paper is an interesting valuable hot topic for energy and environment problems. how to improve biogas production,many scientists all wold have been done much works,"Effect of Initial pH and Saccharomyces cerevisiae Addition on Biogas Production from Salviniamolesta and Kinetics"is belong to one.

the experimental Design of the paper is scientific,data analysis is also reasonable,but some-mistakes are needed to be modified.

1?"600-mL-polyethylene bottles as lab-scale anaerobic batch digesters" ,a schematic diagram of the experimental device needs to be added;

Response:

Thank you. Please check Fig.1.

2?SM as much as 10 g was put into the digesters. Water was added with ratio of SM/water of 1/13 (w/v). What is the basis for determining the quantity on SM and ratio of SM/water ;

Response:

Thank you. Please check point 2.3

3?discuss is lack in paper.

Response:

Thank you. We have added Table 1 to show that this research was new. Some additional explanations about the phenomena VFAs and TAN during AD have been shown on page 9, 10 and 12. Furthermore, please check point 3.3.

4?The number of literature is insufficient and many important literatures are not cited. for examples:

Mao, Chunlan. Linkage of kinetic parameters with process parameters and operational conditions during anaerobic digestion. ENERGY. DOI 10.1016/j.energy.2017.06.050

Response:

Thank you. We have added some literatures. Please check on the manuscript and in references.



iqbal syaichurrozi <iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com>

Submission Confirmation for EGY-D-19-04622R1

1 message

Energy <eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com>

Wed, Dec 11, 2019 at 9:20 PM

Reply-To: Energy <energy@elsevier.com>

To: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

Cc: rafimuhammadf15@gmail.com, rusdi.rachman@gmail.com, fakhri160496@yahoo.com

*** Automated email sent by the system ***

A Preliminary Study: Effect of Initial pH and Saccharomyces cerevisiae Addition on Biogas Production from Salvinia molesta and Kinetics
EGY-D-19-04622R1
Full length article

Dear Dr. syaichurrozi:

I am glad to inform you that your revised paper with the above title and reference number has been received by our office and is under review. We will inform you as soon as the review is completed.

You may check on the progress of your paper by logging on to the Elsevier Editorial System as an author using the following details:

URL: <https://ees.elsevier.com/egy/>Your username is: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

If you can't remember your password please click the "Send Password" link on the Login page.

Thank you for your interest in ENERGY.

Sincerely,

The Editorial Office
ENERGY - The International Journal



iqbal syaichurrozi <iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com>

Your Submission EGY-D-19-04622R1

1 message

Energy <eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com>

Wed, Jan 8, 2020 at 1:59 PM

Reply-To: Energy <energy@elsevier.com>

To: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

Cc: rafimuhammadf15@gmail.com, rusdi.rachman@gmail.com, fakhri160496@yahoo.com

Ms. Ref. No.: EGY-D-19-04622R1

Title: A Preliminary Study: Effect of Initial pH and Saccharomyces cerevisiae Addition on Biogas Production from Salvinia molesta and Kinetics

Energy

Dear Mr. syaichurrozi,

The review of your paper is now complete, the Reviewers' reports are below. As you can see, one Reviewer recommends rejection, and the others recommend possible reconsideration after major revisions. They have presented important points of criticism and a series of recommendations. We kindly ask you to consider all comments and revise the paper accordingly in order to respond fully and in detail to the Reviewers' recommendations. If this process is completed thoroughly, the paper will be acceptable for a second review.

If you choose to revise your manuscript it will be due into the Editorial Office by the Mar 08, 2020

Once you have revised the paper accordingly, please submit it together with a detailed description of your response to these comments. Please, also include a separate copy of the revised paper in which you have marked the revisions made.

Please note if a reviewer suggests you to cite specific literature, you should only do so if you feel the literature is relevant and will improve your paper. Otherwise please ignore such suggestions and indicate this fact to the handling editor in your rebuttal.

To submit a revision, please go to <https://ees.elsevier.com/egy/> and login as an Author.

Your username is: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

If you need to retrieve password details, please go to: http://ees.elsevier.com/egy/automail_query.asp.

NOTE: Upon submitting your revised manuscript, please upload the source files for your article. For additional details regarding acceptable file formats, please refer to the Guide for Authors at: <http://www.elsevier.com/journals/energy/0360-5442/guide-for-authors>

When submitting your revised paper, we ask that you include the following items:

Manuscript and Figure Source Files (mandatory):

We cannot accommodate PDF manuscript files for production purposes. We also ask that when submitting your revision you follow the journal formatting guidelines. Figures and tables may be embedded within the source file for the submission as long as they are of sufficient resolution for Production. For any figure that cannot be embedded within the source file (such as *.PSD Photoshop files), the original figure needs to be uploaded separately. Refer to the Guide for Authors for additional information.

<http://www.elsevier.com/journals/energy/0360-5442/guide-for-authors>

Highlights (mandatory):

Highlights consist of a short collection of bullet points that convey the core findings of the article and should be submitted in a separate file in the online submission system. Please use 'Highlights' in the file name and include 3 to 5 bullet points (maximum 85 characters, including spaces, per bullet point). See the following website for more information

<http://www.elsevier.com/highlights>

In order to give our readers a sense of continuity and since editorial procedure often takes time, we encourage you to update your reference list by conducting an up-to-date literature search as part of your revision.

On your Main Menu page, you will find a folder entitled "Submissions Needing Revision". Your submission record will be presented here.

MethodsX file (optional)

If you have customized (a) research method(s) for the project presented in your Energy article, you are invited to submit this part of your work as MethodsX article alongside your revised research article. MethodsX is an independent journal that publishes the work you have done to develop research methods to your specific needs or setting. This is an opportunity to get full credit for the time and money you may have spent on developing research methods, and to increase the visibility and impact of your work.

How does it work?

- 1) Fill in the MethodsX article template: <https://www.elsevier.com/MethodsX-template>
- 2) Place all MethodsX files (including graphical abstract, figures and other relevant files) into a .zip file and upload this as a 'Method Details (MethodsX)' item alongside your revised Energy manuscript. Please ensure all of your relevant MethodsX documents are zipped into a single file.
- 3) If your Energy research article is accepted, your MethodsX article will automatically be transferred to MethodsX, where it will be reviewed and published as a separate article upon acceptance. MethodsX is a fully Open Access journal, the publication fee is only 520 US\$.

Questions? Please contact the MethodsX team at methodsx@elsevier.com. Example MethodsX articles can be found here: <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/journal/22150161>

Include interactive data visualizations in your publication and let your readers interact and engage more closely with your research. Follow the instructions here: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors/author-services/data-visualization> to find out about available data visualization options and how to include them with your article.

MethodsX file (optional)

We invite you to submit a method article alongside your research article. This is an opportunity to get full credit for the time and money you have spent on developing research methods, and to increase the visibility and impact of your work. If your research article is accepted, your method article will be automatically transferred over to the open access journal, MethodsX, where it will be editorially reviewed and published as a separate method article upon acceptance. Both articles will be linked on ScienceDirect. Please use the MethodsX template available here when preparing your article: <https://www.elsevier.com/MethodsX-template>. Open access fees apply.

Thank you very much for expressing your interest in ENERGY.

Sincerely,

Silvia Azucena Azucena Nebra, Dr.
Subject Editor
Energy
Data in Brief (optional):

We invite you to convert your supplementary data (or a part of it) into an additional journal publication in Data in Brief, a multi-disciplinary open access journal. Data in Brief articles are a fantastic way to describe supplementary data and associated metadata, or full raw datasets deposited in an external repository, which are otherwise unnoticed. A Data in Brief article (which will be reviewed, formatted, indexed, and given a DOI) will make your data easier to find, reproduce, and cite.

You can submit to Data in Brief via the Energy submission system when you upload your revised Energy manuscript. To do so, complete the template and follow the co-submission instructions found here: www.elsevier.com/dib-template. If your Energy manuscript is accepted, your Data in Brief submission will automatically be transferred to Data in Brief for editorial review and publication.

Please note: an open access Article Publication Charge (APC) is payable by the author or research funder to cover the costs associated with publication in Data in Brief and ensure your data article is immediately and permanently free to

access by all. For the current APC see: www.elsevier.com/journals/data-in-brief/2352-3409/open-access-journal

Please contact the Data in Brief editorial office at dib-me@elsevier.com or visit the Data in Brief homepage (www.journals.elsevier.com/data-in-brief/) if you have questions or need further information.

Note: While submitting the revised manuscript, please double check the author names provided in the submission so that authorship related changes are made in the revision stage. If your manuscript is accepted, any authorship change will involve approval from co-authors and respective editor handling the submission and this may cause a significant delay in publishing your manuscript.

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #1: -in p2, "The authors of [6] and [7]", and so on, I haven't seen this writing before, please correct them.
-What is the dosage of SC in this study? The optimal dosage also should be presented in abstract.
-The legend of the figures in the study were not clearly enough.
-There were no enough data in figure 3 and 5.
-Figure 6 could not explain the microbial mechanism of this study enough.
-Useless information was get from figure 7.

Reviewer #2: -In the second reviewer's comments, the discuss was lack in this study, not novelty lack, please check the response carefully.
-according to your introduction, there was lack of novelty to this study. Authors should present it more prominent.
-I think the acid or the alkaline pretreatment was very necessary, it should be presented in abstract.

Reviewer #3: The manuscript "A Preliminary Study: Effect of Initial pH and Saccharomyces cerevisiae Addition on Biogas Production from Salvinia molesta and Kinetics" studies the anaerobic digestion of Salvinia molesta with different treatment by initial pH and Saccharomyces cerevisiae. The manuscript has been greatly revised, but I have a doubt: in Table 4, the λ of DR5 and DR6 in Modified Gompertz Model is negative, the lag time is abnormal. Please check the model for errors, if not, please further explanation.

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923> Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EES via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.

Reviewer #1: -in p2, "The authors of [6] and [7]", and so on, I haven't seen this writing before, please correct them.

Response:

Thank you. We have revised them.

-What is the dosage of SC in this study? The optimal dosage also should be presented in abstract.

Response:

Thank you. Please see section 2.3. "SC as much as 1 g was added (dose of 1 g SC for 10 g SM). This dose approaches the previous study (dose of 1 g SC for 12.5 g solid wastes [11,12])."

We also have added it in abstract.

-The legend of the figures in the study were not clearly enough.

Response:

Thank you. We have added additional information after title of the figures.

-There were no enough data in figure 3 and 5.

Response:

Thank you for your advice. In figure 3 and 5, the data were obtained at day 0, 15, 30 for all variables. The data might be not enough but hopefully we have explained it with deep explanation enough. Please see page 8-9 and 12-13.

-Figure 6 could not explain the microbial mechanism of this study enough.

Response:

Thank you for your advice. The data in Fig.6 might be not enough to explain detail microbial mechanism during AD. However, at least it has given a rough phenomenon about the effect of the yeast addition in the AD process. Hopefully, this data is enough for this preliminary study. However, a further study with detail analysis about microbial mechanism through metatranscriptomics and -proteomics analysis should be conducted in the future.

-Useless information was get from figure 7.

Response:

Thank you. We have deleted the figure 7.

Reviewer #2: -In the second reviewer's comments, the discuss was lack in this study, not novelty lack, please check the response carefully.

-according to your introduction, there was lack of novelty to this study. Authors should present it more prominent.

Response:

Thank you. We have revised the introduction. Please see page 3-4.

-I think the acid or the alkaline pretreatment was very necessary, it should be presented in abstract.

Response:

Thank you. We have added it in abstract

Reviewer #3: The manuscript "A Preliminary Study: Effect of Initial pH and *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* Addition on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta* and Kinetics" studies the anaerobic digestion of *Salvinia molesta* with different treatment by initial pH and *Saccharomyces cerevisiae*. The manuscript has been greatly revised, but I have a doubt: in Table 4, the λ of DR5 and DR6 in Modified Gompertz Model is negative, the lag time is abnormal. Please check the model for errors, if not, please further explanation.

Response:

Thank you. We have added a explanation “The negative value of λ (below 0) is not surprising because it represented that bacteria no need lag time to produce biogas; in other words, the lag time was 0 day. Previous study [8] also reported that the negative value of λ could be obtained in modeling when the biogas was very easy to be produced in first fermentation.”. Please see page 15-16.



iqbal syaichurrozi <iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com>

Submission Confirmation for EGY-D-19-04622R2

1 message

Energy <eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com>

Fri, Feb 21, 2020 at 7:04 PM

Reply-To: Energy <energy@elsevier.com>

To: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

Cc: rafimuhammadf15@gmail.com, rusdi.rachman@gmail.com, fakhri160496@yahoo.com

*** Automated email sent by the system ***

A Preliminary Study: Effect of Initial pH and Saccharomyces cerevisiae Addition on Biogas Production from Salvinia molesta and Kinetics
EGY-D-19-04622R2
Full length article

Dear Dr. syaichurrozi:

I am glad to inform you that your revised paper with the above title and reference number has been received by our office and is under review. We will inform you as soon as the review is completed.

You may check on the progress of your paper by logging on to the Elsevier Editorial System as an author using the following details:

URL: <https://ees.elsevier.com/egy/>Your username is: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

If you can't remember your password please click the "Send Password" link on the Login page.

Thank you for your interest in ENERGY.

Sincerely,

The Editorial Office
ENERGY - The International Journal



iqbal syaichurrozi <iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com>

Your Submission

1 message

Energy <eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com>

Fri, May 8, 2020 at 12:57 AM

Reply-To: Energy <energy@elsevier.com>

To: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

Cc: rafimuhammadf15@gmail.com, rusdi.rachman@gmail.com, fakhri160496@yahoo.com

Ms. Ref. No.: EGY-D-19-04622R2

Title: A Preliminary Study: Effect of Initial pH and Saccharomyces cerevisiae Addition on Biogas Production from Salvinia molesta and Kinetics

Energy

Dear Mr. syaichurrozi,

The review of your paper is now complete, the Reviewers' reports are below. As you can see, the Reviewers present important points of criticism and a series of recommendations. We kindly ask you to consider all comments and revise the paper accordingly in order to respond fully and in detail to the Reviewers' recommendations. If this process is completed thoroughly, the paper will be acceptable for a second review.

If you choose to revise your manuscript it will be due into the Editorial Office by the Jun 21, 2020

Once you have revised the paper accordingly, please submit it together with a detailed description of your response to these comments. Please, also include a separate copy of the revised paper in which you have marked the revisions made.

Please note if a reviewer suggests you to cite specific literature, you should only do so if you feel the literature is relevant and will improve your paper. Otherwise please ignore such suggestions and indicate this fact to the handling editor in your rebuttal.

To submit a revision, please go to <https://ees.elsevier.com/egy/> and login as an Author.

Your username is: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

If you need to retrieve password details, please go to: http://ees.elsevier.com/egy/automail_query.asp.

NOTE: Upon submitting your revised manuscript, please upload the source files for your article. For additional details regarding acceptable file formats, please refer to the Guide for Authors at: <http://www.elsevier.com/journals/energy/0360-5442/guide-for-authors>

When submitting your revised paper, we ask that you include the following items:

Manuscript and Figure Source Files (mandatory):

We cannot accommodate PDF manuscript files for production purposes. We also ask that when submitting your revision you follow the journal formatting guidelines. Figures and tables may be embedded within the source file for the submission as long as they are of sufficient resolution for Production. For any figure that cannot be embedded within the source file (such as *.PSD Photoshop files), the original figure needs to be uploaded separately. Refer to the Guide for Authors for additional information.

<http://www.elsevier.com/journals/energy/0360-5442/guide-for-authors>

Highlights (mandatory):

Highlights consist of a short collection of bullet points that convey the core findings of the article and should be submitted in a separate file in the online submission system. Please use 'Highlights' in the file name and include 3 to 5 bullet points (maximum 85 characters, including spaces, per bullet point). See the following website for more information

<http://www.elsevier.com/highlights>

In order to give our readers a sense of continuity and since editorial procedure often takes time, we encourage you to update your reference list by conducting an up-to-date literature search as part of your revision.

On your Main Menu page, you will find a folder entitled "Submissions Needing Revision". Your submission record will be presented here.

MethodsX file (optional)

If you have customized (a) research method(s) for the project presented in your Energy article, you are invited to submit this part of your work as MethodsX article alongside your revised research article. MethodsX is an independent journal that publishes the work you have done to develop research methods to your specific needs or setting. This is an opportunity to get full credit for the time and money you may have spent on developing research methods, and to increase the visibility and impact of your work.

How does it work?

- 1) Fill in the MethodsX article template: <https://www.elsevier.com/MethodsX-template>
- 2) Place all MethodsX files (including graphical abstract, figures and other relevant files) into a .zip file and upload this as a 'Method Details (MethodsX)' item alongside your revised Energy manuscript. Please ensure all of your relevant MethodsX documents are zipped into a single file.
- 3) If your Energy research article is accepted, your MethodsX article will automatically be transferred to MethodsX, where it will be reviewed and published as a separate article upon acceptance. MethodsX is a fully Open Access journal, the publication fee is only 520 US\$.

Questions? Please contact the MethodsX team at methodsx@elsevier.com. Example MethodsX articles can be found here: <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/journal/22150161>

Include interactive data visualizations in your publication and let your readers interact and engage more closely with your research. Follow the instructions here: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors/author-services/data-visualization> to find out about available data visualization options and how to include them with your article.

MethodsX file (optional)

We invite you to submit a method article alongside your research article. This is an opportunity to get full credit for the time and money you have spent on developing research methods, and to increase the visibility and impact of your work. If your research article is accepted, your method article will be automatically transferred over to the open access journal, MethodsX, where it will be editorially reviewed and published as a separate method article upon acceptance. Both articles will be linked on ScienceDirect. Please use the MethodsX template available here when preparing your article: <https://www.elsevier.com/MethodsX-template>. Open access fees apply.

Thank you very much for expressing your interest in ENERGY.

Sincerely,

Silvia Azucena Azucena Nebra, Dr.
Subject Editor
Energy

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #2: -In the highlight, the mechanism of the anaerobic digestion enhancement of the SC addition should be presented.

-The acid pretreatment was very important in this study, why was it not included in the title?

-From references [8] and [9], what is the novelty of this study? The introduction should emphasize the recent existing problems and what is your novelty.

-In fig.3 and 5, only three data were shown in one treatment, it was not enough to explain something.

-In fig.6, how to predict the amount of SC cell?

Reviewer #3: The article "A Preliminary Study: Effect of Initial pH and Saccharomyces cerevisiae Addition on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta* and Kinetics" (EGY-D-19-04622R2) have made great efforts to satisfy the reviewers' opinions, and the article has reached the level of publication. So I have no other opinions, and recommend published in the journal.

Data in Brief (optional):

We invite you to convert your supplementary data (or a part of it) into an additional journal publication in Data in Brief, a multi-disciplinary open access journal. Data in Brief articles are a fantastic way to describe supplementary data and associated metadata, or full raw datasets deposited in an external repository, which are otherwise unnoticed. A Data in Brief article (which will be reviewed, formatted, indexed, and given a DOI) will make your data easier to find, reproduce, and cite.

You can submit to Data in Brief via the Energy submission system when you upload your revised Energy manuscript. To do so, complete the template and follow the co-submission instructions found here: www.elsevier.com/dib-template. If your Energy manuscript is accepted, your Data in Brief submission will automatically be transferred to Data in Brief for editorial review and publication.

Please note: an open access Article Publication Charge (APC) is payable by the author or research funder to cover the costs associated with publication in Data in Brief and ensure your data article is immediately and permanently free to access by all. For the current APC see: www.elsevier.com/journals/data-in-brief/2352-3409/open-access-journal

Please contact the Data in Brief editorial office at dib-me@elsevier.com or visit the Data in Brief homepage (www.journals.elsevier.com/data-in-brief/) if you have questions or need further information.

Note: While submitting the revised manuscript, please double check the author names provided in the submission so that authorship related changes are made in the revision stage. If your manuscript is accepted, any authorship change will involve approval from co-authors and respective editor handling the submission and this may cause a significant delay in publishing your manuscript.

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923> Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EES via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.

Reviewer #2:

-In the highlight, the mechanism of the anaerobic digestion enhancement of the SC addition should be presented.

Response: Thank you. We have added information about it in the highlights.

-The acid pretreatment was very important in this study, why was it not included in the title?

Response: Thank you so much. We have revised the title of the manuscript. Page 1.

-From references [8] and [9], what is the novelty of this study? The introduction should emphasize the recent existing problems and what is your novelty.

Response: Thank you. We have added some information in Introduction to show the novelty of this study.

On page 2-3

Furthermore, the [2] found that co-digestion of SM and rice straw produced higher biogas yield than mono-digestion with biogas yield of $113.92 \text{ mLg}^{-1}\text{-VS}$ for the co-digestion and that of $6.30 \text{ mLg}^{-1}\text{-VS}$ for the mono-digestion. This concept was effective enough but the rice straw is not available throughout the year because Indonesian farmers only grew rice plants in rainy season. Moreover, the [8] could increase biogas yield from SM by sulfuric acid pretreatment. However, the biogas yield was still very low ($24.14 \text{ mLg}^{-1}\text{-VS}$). Therefore, another innovation is needed to increase biogas yield from SM.

On page 3

Based on Table 1, effectiveness of yeast addition in enhancing biogas production depends on the kind of biogas feedstock and then value of initial pH. However, there is no information about the effect of SC addition at various initial pH values on biogas yield from SM.

Therefore, it was attractive to be investigated in this study.

On page 4

This study was new and other authors have not studied it yet. Based on explanation above, the novelty of this study was utilization of SC as a microbial agent to increase biogas yield from acid-pretreated SM (pSM), variation of initial pH to find its optimum value in AD of pSM with or without SC addition and simulation of the biogas evolution using some kinetic models in this new case. The goals of this study were to investigate the effect of SC addition at various initial pH values (5-8) on biogas yield from (pSM) and simulate the biogas production using some kinetic models (modified Gompertz, Cone, first order kinetic model)

to find the kinetic constants explaining the effect of SC addition on biogas yield quantitatively.

-In fig.3 and 5, only three data were shown in one treatment, it was not enough to explain something.

Response: Thank you. In figure 3 and 5, the data were obtained at day 0, 15, 30 for all variables. The data might be not enough but hopefully we have explained it with deep explanation enough. Please see page 9-10 and 13-14.

-In fig.6, how to predict the amount of SC cell?

Response: Thank you. We have added information about it. Page 15.

Reviewer #3:

The article "A Preliminary Study: Effect of Initial pH and *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* Addition on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta* and Kinetics" (EGY-D-19-04622R2) have made great efforts to satisfy the reviewers' opinions, and the article has reached the level of publication. So I have no other opinions, and recommend published in the journal.

Response: Thank you so much.



iqbal syaichurrozi <iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com>

Submission Confirmation for EGY-D-19-04622R3

1 message

Energy <eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com>

Sat, May 9, 2020 at 12:54 PM

Reply-To: Energy <energy@elsevier.com>

To: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

Cc: rafimuhammadf15@gmail.com, rusdi.rachman@gmail.com, fakhri160496@yahoo.com

*** Automated email sent by the system ***

A Preliminary Study: Effect of Initial pH and Saccharomyces cerevisiae Addition on Biogas Production from Acid-
Pretreated Salvinia molesta and Kinetics
EGY-D-19-04622R3
Full length article

Dear Dr. syaichurrozi:

I am glad to inform you that your revised paper with the above title and reference number has been received by our office and is under review. We will inform you as soon as the review is completed.

You may check on the progress of your paper by logging on to the Elsevier Editorial System as an author using the following details:

URL: <https://ees.elsevier.com/egy/>Your username is: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

If you can't remember your password please click the "Send Password" link on the Login page.

Thank you for your interest in ENERGY.

Sincerely,

The Editorial Office
ENERGY - The International Journal



iqbal syaichurrozi <iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com>

Your Submission

2 messages

Energy <eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com>

Tue, Jun 23, 2020 at 7:49 PM

Reply-To: Energy <energy@elsevier.com>

To: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

Cc: rafimuhammadf15@gmail.com, rusdi.rachman@gmail.com, fakhri160496@yahoo.com

Ms. Ref. No.: EGY-D-19-04622R3

Title: A Preliminary Study: Effect of Initial pH and Saccharomyces cerevisiae Addition on Biogas Production from Acid-Pretreated Salvinia molesta and Kinetics
Energy

Dear Mr. syaichurrozi,

I am pleased to inform you that your paper "A Preliminary Study: Effect of Initial pH and Saccharomyces cerevisiae Addition on Biogas Production from Acid-Pretreated Salvinia molesta and Kinetics" has been accepted for publication in Energy.

The publisher will send you the proofs as a PDF file when ready. At this stage please make all necessary corrections when you receive these proofs.

Your accepted manuscript will now be transferred to our production department and work will begin on creation of the proof. If we need any additional information to create the proof, we will let you know. If not, you will be contacted again in the next few days with a request to approve the proof and to complete a number of online forms that are required for publication.

Include interactive data visualizations in your publication and let your readers interact and engage more closely with your research. Follow the instructions here: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors/author-services/data-visualization> to find out about available data visualization options and how to include them with your article.

MethodsX file (optional)

We invite you to submit a method article alongside your research article. This is an opportunity to get full credit for the time and money you have spent on developing research methods, and to increase the visibility and impact of your work. If your research article is accepted, your method article will be automatically transferred over to the open access journal, MethodsX, where it will be editorially reviewed and published as a separate method article upon acceptance. Both articles will be linked on ScienceDirect. Please use the MethodsX template available here when preparing your article: <https://www.elsevier.com/MethodsX-template>. Open access fees apply.

Thank you very much for expressing your interest in ENERGY.

Sincerely,

Silvia Azucena Azucena Nebra, Dr.

Subject Editor

Energy

Data in Brief (optional):

We invite you to convert your supplementary data (or a part of it) into an additional journal publication in Data in Brief, a multi-disciplinary open access journal. Data in Brief articles are a fantastic way to describe supplementary data and associated metadata, or full raw datasets deposited in an external repository, which are otherwise unnoticed. A Data in Brief article (which will be reviewed, formatted, indexed, and given a DOI) will make your data easier to find, reproduce, and cite.

You can submit to Data in Brief via the Energy submission system when you upload your revised Energy manuscript. To do so, complete the template and follow the co-submission instructions found here: www.elsevier.com/dib-template. If your Energy manuscript is accepted, your Data in Brief submission will automatically be transferred to Data in Brief for editorial review and publication.

Please note: an open access Article Publication Charge (APC) is payable by the author or research funder to cover the costs associated with publication in Data in Brief and ensure your data article is immediately and permanently free to access by all. For the current APC see: www.elsevier.com/journals/data-in-brief/2352-3409/open-access-journal

Please contact the Data in Brief editorial office at dib-me@elsevier.com or visit the Data in Brief homepage (www.journals.elsevier.com/data-in-brief/) if you have questions or need further information.

Energy <eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com>

Tue, Jun 23, 2020 at 7:49 PM

Reply-To: Energy <energy@elsevier.com>

To: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

Cc: rafimuhammadf15@gmail.com, rusdi.rachman@ymail.com, fakhri160496@yahoo.com

*** Automated email sent by the system ***

Ms. Ref. No.: EGY-D-19-04622R3

Title: A Preliminary Study: Effect of Initial pH and *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* Addition on Biogas Production from Acid-Pretreated *Salvinia molesta* and Kinetics
Energy

Dear Mr. yaichurrozi,

I am pleased to confirm that your accepted manuscript has now been sent to production for typesetting.

Your accepted manuscript will now be transferred to our production department and work will begin on creation of the proof. If we need any additional information to create the proof, we will let you know. If not, you will be contacted again in the next few days with a request to approve the proof and to complete a number of online forms that are required for publication.

Kind regards,

Energy

Comments from the Editors and Reviewers:

Reviewer #2: It could be accepted by the current status.

Reviewer #3: I have no other opinions of the article "A Preliminary Study: Effect of Initial pH and *Saccharomyces cerevisiae* Addition on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta* and Kinetics" (EGY-D-19-04622R3), the article can be accepted by journal.