



iqbal syaichurrozi <iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com>

Submission Confirmation

1 message

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com>

Sat, Sep 8, 2018 at 6:39 AM

Reply-To: Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <jece@elsevier.com>

To: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

*** Automated email sent by the system ***

Ms. Ref. No.:

Title: Effect of Sulfuric Acid Pretreatment on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta*
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering
Research Paper

Dear Dr. iqbal syaichurrozi,

We have received your article "Effect of Sulfuric Acid Pretreatment on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta*" for consideration for publication in Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

Your manuscript will be given a reference number once an editor has been assigned.

To track the status of your paper, please do the following:

1. Go to this URL: <https://ees.elsevier.com/jece/>
2. Log in as an Author
3. Click [Submissions Being Processed]

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal.

Kind regards,

Elsevier Editorial System
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Please note that the editorial process varies considerably from journal to journal. For more information about the submission-to-publication lifecycle, click here: http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/p/7923/a_id/160

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EES via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.



iqbal syaichurrozi <iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com>

A manuscript number has been assigned: JECE-D-18-01809

1 message

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com>

Wed, Sep 12, 2018 at 12:41 PM

Reply-To: Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <jece@elsevier.com>

To: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

Ms. Ref. No.: JECE-D-18-01809

Title: Effect of Sulfuric Acid Pretreatment on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta*
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Dear Dr. iqbal syaichurrozi,

Your submission "Effect of Sulfuric Acid Pretreatment on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta*" has been assigned manuscript number JECE-D-18-01809.

To track the status of your paper, please do the following:

1. Go to this URL: <https://ees.elsevier.com/jece/>
2. Enter your login details
3. Click [Author Login]
This takes you to the Author Main Menu.
4. Click [Submissions Being Processed]

Thank you for submitting your work to Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

Kind regards,

Administrative Support Agent
Administrative Support Agent [19-Jan-14]
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Please note that the editorial process varies considerably from journal to journal. To view a sample editorial process, please click here:

http://ees.elsevier.com/eeshelp/sample_editorial_process.pdf

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EES via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.



iqbal syaichurrozi <iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com>

Editor handles JECE-D-18-01809

1 message

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com>Wed, Sep 12, 2018 at 12:41
PM

Reply-To: Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <jece@elsevier.com>

To: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

Ms. Ref. No.: JECE-D-18-01809

Title: Effect of Sulfuric Acid Pretreatment on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta*
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Dear Dr. iqbal syaichurrozi,

Your submission "Effect of Sulfuric Acid Pretreatment on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta*" will be handled by Editor Teik Thye (T.T.) Lim, Ph.D..You may check the progress of your paper by logging into the Elsevier Editorial System as an author at <https://ees.elsevier.com/jece/>.

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal.

Kind regards,

Elsevier Editorial System
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>
Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EES via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.



iqbal syaichurrozi <iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com>

Your Submission - JECE-D-18-01809

1 message

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com>

Fri, Oct 26, 2018 at 1:13 PM

Reply-To: Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <jece@elsevier.com>

To: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

Ms. Ref. No.: JECE-D-18-01809

Title: Effect of Sulfuric Acid Pretreatment on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta*
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Dear Dr. syaichurrozi,

Thank you for submitting the above paper to Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering. Your manuscript needs major revisions.

The reviewers comments are included below for your attention. Please carefully address the issues raised in the comments. I invite you to submit your revised manuscript.

The due date for submitting your revised manuscript is Nov 25, 2018

If you are submitting a revised manuscript, please also:

a) outline each change made (point by point) as raised in the reviewer comments

AND

b) provide a suitable rebuttal to each reviewer comment not addressed

In order to facilitate the check of your manuscript, all the changes made during revision should appear in a different color. That is, the font color should be changed from black to red or blue (directly in the text) rather than using the track changes in Microsoft Word. A response letter for the revised manuscript should be sent to the editor along with your responses to the reviewer comments. These two steps are mandatory for the further review of the manuscript.

To submit your revision, please do the following:

1. Go to: <https://ees.elsevier.com/jece/>
2. Enter your login details
3. Click [Author Login]
This takes you to the Author Main Menu.
4. Click [Submissions Needing Revision]

PDFs are not acceptable revised manuscript files. Please prepare your manuscript text (with author details), tables, figure legends and any acknowledgements as a single Word file. Please prepare your Figures in an approved format (TIFF, EPS or MS Office files) with the correct resolution. Prepare any supporting information such as 'Response to Reviewers' as a separate Word file.

NOTE: Upon submitting your revised manuscript, please upload the source files for your article. For additional details regarding acceptable file formats, please refer to the Guide for Authors at: <http://www.elsevier.com/journals/journal-of-environmental-chemical-engineering/2213-3437/guide-for-authors>

When submitting your revised paper, we ask that you include the following items:

Manuscript and Figure Source Files (mandatory)

We cannot accommodate PDF manuscript files for production purposes. We also ask that when submitting your revision you follow the journal formatting guidelines. Figures and tables may be embedded within the source file for the submission as long as they are of sufficient visual quality. For any figure that cannot be embedded within the source file (such as *.PSD Photoshop files), the original figure needs to be uploaded separately. Refer to the Guide for Authors for additional information.

Highlights (optional)

Highlights consist of a short collection of bullet points that convey the core findings of the article and should be submitted in a separate file in the online submission system. Please use 'Highlights' in the file name and include 3 to 5 bullet points (maximum 85 characters, including spaces, per bullet point). See the following website for more information <http://www.elsevier.com/highlights>

Graphical Abstract (optional)

Graphical Abstracts should summarize the contents of the article in a concise, pictorial form designed to capture the attention of a wide readership online. Refer to the following website for more information: <http://www.elsevier.com/graphicalabstracts>

Please note that this journal offers a new, free service called AudioSlides: brief, webcast-style presentations that are shown next to published articles on ScienceDirect (see also <http://www.elsevier.com/audioslides>). If your paper is accepted for publication, you will automatically receive an invitation to create an AudioSlides presentation.

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering features the Interactive Plot Viewer, see: <http://www.elsevier.com/interactiveplots>. Interactive Plots provide easy access to the data behind plots. To include one with your article, please prepare a .csv file with your plot data and test it online at <http://authortools.elsevier.com/interactiveplots/verification> before submission as supplementary material.

Data in Brief (optional)

We invite you to convert your supplementary data (or a part of it) into a Data in Brief article. Data in Brief articles are descriptions of the data and associated metadata which are normally buried in supplementary material. They are actively reviewed, curated, formatted, indexed, given a DOI and freely available to all upon publication. Data in Brief should be uploaded with your revised manuscript directly to Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering. If your Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering research article is accepted, your Data in Brief article will automatically be transferred over to our new, fully Open Access journal, Data in Brief, where it will be editorially reviewed and published as a separate data article upon acceptance. The Open Access fee for Data in Brief is \$500.

Please just fill in the template found here: https://www.elsevier.com/__data/assets/word_doc/0004/215779/Datainbrief_template.docx. Then, place all Data in Brief files (whichever supplementary files you would like to include as well as your completed Data in Brief template) into a .zip file and upload this as a Data in Brief item alongside your Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering revised manuscript. Note that only this Data in Brief item will be transferred over to Data in Brief, so ensure all of your relevant Data in Brief documents are zipped into a single file. Also, make sure you change references to supplementary material in your Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering manuscript to reference the Data in Brief article where appropriate.

Questions? Please send your inquiries to dib@elsevier.com. Example Data in Brief can be found here: <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/journal/23523409>
MethodsX file (optional)

If you have customized (a) research method(s) for the project presented in your Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering article, you are invited to submit this part of your work as MethodsX article alongside your revised research article. MethodsX is an independent journal that publishes the work you have done to develop research methods to your specific needs or setting. This is an opportunity to get full credit for the time and money you may have spent on developing research methods, and to increase the visibility and impact of your work.

How does it work?

- 1) Fill in the MethodsX article template: <https://www.elsevier.com/MethodsX-template>
- 2) Place all MethodsX files (including graphical abstract, figures and other relevant files) into a .zip file and upload this as a 'Method Details (MethodsX)' item alongside your revised Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering manuscript. Please ensure all of your relevant MethodsX documents are zipped into a single file.
- 3) If your Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering research article is accepted, your MethodsX article will automatically be transferred to MethodsX, where it will be reviewed and published as a separate article upon acceptance. MethodsX is a fully Open Access journal, the publication fee is only 520 US\$.

Questions? Please contact the MethodsX team at methodsx@elsevier.com. Example MethodsX articles can be found here: <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/journal/22150161>

Include interactive data visualizations in your publication and let your readers interact and engage more closely with your research. Follow the instructions here: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors/author-services/data-visualization> to find out about available data visualization options and how to include them with your article.

I look forward to receiving your revised manuscript.

Yours sincerely,

Teik Thye (T.T.) Lim, Ph.D.
Editor
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Note: After the paper is accepted to production, we do not allow any authorship changes in your article since the editor would like to approve any changes to the authorship before acceptance of papers in EES.

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #1:

The article entitled "Effect of Sulfuric Acid Pretreatment on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta*" is not a novel work. The data presented in it contains nothing new findings that enables reader to expand their present knowledge in the concerned field. Moreover, the presentation of the manuscript and English language is extremely poor. Most of the sentences in all sections need to be reconstructed carefully. Hence, I am against the publication of this article in the present journal.

Specific comments:

Comment 1: Introduction: The text of the Introduction is not properly drafted. The text should be better organized and the objectives should be better defined. The significance of this study is not properly justified.

Comment 2: Introduction: Present brief but critical review of literature. Authors should highlight the novelty and innovation in relation to other papers.

Comment 3: Materials and Methods: The text need to be rewritten for a better understanding; rigorous description of what was really performed and a format of scientific work are required.

Comment 4: Result & Discussion: This section contains no novel and interesting findings. Use of English language is very poor.

Reviewer #2:

An interesting paper that is in the technical scope of the journal.

Recommendations:

1. Determination of the SM contents would be of great interest using NREL procedures.
2. There are some areas required to improve clearly and it requires careful revision.
3. All the Equations should follow the journal guideline to prepare them.
4. Biomass is composed of hemicellulose, cellulose, lignin. All these components can produce biogases and many value-added chemicals. Related topics should be mentioned.
5. The authors may follow to comment the technology and catalyst development for the biogas production and perspectives.
6. The references can be updated and expanded. There are some recent ones that should be discussed in the review text. Also there are some related reviews that can be cited.
7. The paper needs editing for language and grammar.
8. Key issues in modelling and optimization of biomass pretreatment should be considered.

Reviewer #3:

The manuscript presents interesting information and results regarding the use of an abundant biomass in Indonesia for

the production of a biofuel. Authors investigated the effect of chemical pretreatment using sulfuric acid on biogas production from *Salvinia molesta* (SM). The sulfuric acid concentration was varied to be control and pretreated SM was used as biogas feedstock in laboratory scale anaerobic digesters under room temperature. Chemical pretreatment using sulfuric acid seems to successfully increased biogas production from SM.

In my opinion, discussion section should be improved.

Was the biogas production interesting when compared to other substrates? Does the research have potential for scaling up and real implementation? Authors should clarify these points.

Another point that I consider very important is information about the reproducibility of experiments. Authors should include an item in the methodology section detailing replicates performed per experiment and also need to include statistical treatment of the data in the manuscript, especially in Tables 1 and 2.

In this sense, I recommend a substantial revision of the manuscript prior to its publication.

Reviewer #4:

The manuscript JECE JECE-D-18-01809 is a research study on pretreatment of *Salvinia molesta* using Sulfuric acid at different concentrations. The authors have found the pretreatment method to be fruitful in biogas production from the selected biomass. However, it has not been clearly stated regarding the status of used sulfuric acid after the pretreatment process. Moreover, the methodology needs to be clearly written which in fact the author has stated very briefly in the manuscript. In addition, poor English is a major concern in the acceptance of the paper in its present form.

I have included my comments in the uploaded pdf copy of the manuscript where I feel corrections and improvements are required. Please refer to JECE-D-18-01809 (1).pdf

Please note that the editorial process varies considerably from journal to journal. To view the submission-to-publication lifecycle, click here: http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/p/7923/a_id/160

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EES via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.

Reviewer #1:

The article entitled "Effect of Sulfuric Acid Pretreatment on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta*" is not a novel work. The data presented in it contains nothing new findings that enables reader to expand their present knowledge in the concerned field. Moreover, the presentation of the manuscript and English language is extremely poor. Most of the sentences in all sections need to be reconstructed carefully. Hence, I am against the publication of this article in the present journal.

Specific comments:

Comment 1: Introduction: The text of the Introduction is not properly drafted. The text should be better organized and the objectives should be better defined. The significance of this study is not properly justified.

Response:

We have revised some text in Introduction. Please check:

Line 43-63

Line 86-90

Line 94-105

Comment 2: Introduction: Present brief but critical review of literature. Authors should highlight the novelty and innovation in relation to other papers.

Response:

We have revised some text in Introduction. Please check: Line 68-81

Line 94-105

Comment 3: Materials and Methods: The text need to be rewritten for a better understanding; rigorous description of what was really performed and a format of scientific work are required.

Response:

Thank you. Please check our revisions in part of Methods

Line 116-118

Line 121-123

Line 127-129

Line 136

Line 140-145

Line 151-153

Line 156-163

Comment 4: Result & Discussion: This section contains no novel and interesting findings. Use of English language is very poor.

Response:

Thank you. Please check:

Line 217-226

Line 229-253

Line 308-324

Line 420-453

Reviewer #2:

An interesting paper that is in the technical scope of the journal.

Recommendations:

1. Determination of the SM contents would be of great interest using NREL procedures.

Response:

In this study, we used proximate and van soest analysis. Please check Line 127-129

2. There are some areas required to improve clearly and it requires careful revision.

Response:

Thank you. We have revised some areas. Please check the revisions on the paper.

3. All the Equations should follow the journal guideline to prepare them.

Response:

Thank you. Please check:

Line 171-173

Line 184-185

Line 198

Line 423-425

4. Biomass is composed of hemicellulose, cellulose, lignin. All these components can produce biogases and many value-added chemicals. Related topics should be mentioned.

Response:

Thank you. Please check Line 229-246

5. The authors may follow to comment the technology and catalyst development for the biogas production and perspectives.

Response:

Thank you. Please check:

Line 43-63

Line 421-453

6. The references can be updated and expanded. There are some recent ones that should be discussed in the review text. Also there are some related reviews that can be cited.

Response:

Thank you. Please check:

Line 308-324

Line 7, Line 558, Line 560

7. The paper needs editing for language and grammar.

Response:

Thank you. We have edited this paper. Please check.

8. Key issues in modelling and optimization of biomass pretreatment should be considered.

Response:

Thank you. Please check:

Line 74-81

Line 94-105

Reviewer #3:

The manuscript presents interesting information and results regarding the use of an abundant biomass in Indonesia for the production of a biofuel. Authors investigated the effect of chemical pretreatment using sulfuric acid on biogas production from *Salvinia molesta* (SM). The sulfuric acid concentration was varied to be control and pretreated SM was used as biogas feedstock in laboratory scale anaerobic digesters under room temperature. Chemical pretreatment using sulfuric acid seems to successfully increased biogas production from SM.

In my opinion, discussion section should be improved.

Was the biogas production interesting when compared to other substrates?

Response:

Thank you. Please check Line 308-324

Does the research have potential for scaling up and real implementation? authors should clarify these points.

Response:

Thank you. Please check Line 420-453

Another point that I consider very important is information about the reproducibility of experiments. Authors should include an item in the methodology section detailing replicates performed per experiment and also need to include statistical treatment of the data in the manuscript, especially in Tables 1 and 2.

Response:

Thank you. There is no replication in this study. That means the experiment was conducted only once. Please check Line 129 and Line 152-153

In this sense, I recommend a substantial revision of the manuscript prior to its publication.

Response:

Thank you so much. Please check our revisions on the paper.

Reviewer #4:

The manuscript JECE JECE-D-18-01809 is a research study on pretreatment of *Salvinia molesta* using Sulfuric acid at different concentrations. The authors have found the pretreatment method to be fruitful in biogas production from the selected biomass.

However, it has not been clearly stated regarding the status of used sulfuric acid after the pretreatment process.

Response:

Thank you. Please check Line 122-123

Moreover, the methodology needs to be clearly written which in fact the author has stated very briefly in the manuscript.

Response:

Thank you. Please check our revisions

Line 116-118

Line 122-123

Line 127-129

Line 136-137

Line 140-145

Line 151-153

Line 156-163

In addition, poor English is a major concern in the acceptance of the paper in its present form.

Response:

Thank you. We have revised the paper.

I have included my comments in the uploaded pdf copy of the manuscript where I feel corrections and improvements are required. Please refer to JECE-D-18-01809 (1).pdf

Response:

Thank you. We have revised some texts that you have commented on the paper. Please check.



iqbal syaichurrozi <iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com>

Submission Confirmation for JECE-D-18-01809R11 message

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com>

Sun, Nov 25, 2018 at 11:41 PM

Reply-To: Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <jece@elsevier.com>

To: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

*** Automated email sent by the system ***

Ms. Ref. No.: JECE-D-18-01809R1

Title: Effect of Sulfuric Acid Pretreatment on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta*
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering
Research Paper

Dear Mr. iqbal syaichurrozi,

This message is to acknowledge that we have received your revised manuscript for reconsideration for publication in Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

You may check the status of your manuscript by logging into the Elsevier Editorial System as an author at <https://ees.elsevier.com/jece/>.

Thank you for submitting your work to Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

Kind regards,

Elsevier Editorial System
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EES via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.



iqbal syaichurrozi <iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com>

Your Submission - JECE-D-18-01809R1

1 message

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com>Thu, Dec 20, 2018 at 9:28
PM

Reply-To: Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <jece@elsevier.com>

To: iqbalsyaichurrozi@gmail.com

Ms. Ref. No.: JECE-D-18-01809R1

Title: Effect of Sulfuric Acid Pretreatment on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta*
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Dear Mr. syaichurrozi,

I am pleased to inform you that your manuscript "Effect of Sulfuric Acid Pretreatment on Biogas Production from *Salvinia molesta*" has been accepted for publication in Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

Below are comments from the editor and reviewers.

Once your paper is entered in our Production system, we aim to provide you with a typeset proof within 24 hours.

Thank you for submitting your work to Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

Your accepted manuscript will now be transferred to our production department and work will begin on creation of the proof. If we need any additional information to create the proof, we will let you know. If not, you will be contacted again in the next few days with a request to approve the proof and to complete a number of online forms that are required for publication.

Yours sincerely,

Teik Thye (T.T.) Lim, Ph.D.
Editor
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Comments from the editors and reviewers:

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EES via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.