An Error Analysis in Translating Recount Text by Students from the English Department of Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University

H. John Pahamzah[a], Wieka Barathayomi[b], Marina Setiawati[c], Email:
[a]jhon.pahamzah@untirta.ac.id,   [b]wieka.barathayomi@untirta.ac.id,
[c]marina.setiawati@untirta.ac.id,

The objectives of this research were to examine the quality of the students' translation in recount text and to find out the difficulties of translation the recount text by fifth-semester students' of English Department of Teacher Training and Education Faculty of Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University. This research used qualitative research method by implementing a content analysis research design. The researchers took about 40 students from the English Department of Teacher Training and Education Faculty of Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University as the subject of this research. To obtain the data, the researchers used translating test to know the quality of the students' translating and used a questionnaire to find out the student's difficulties of translating of recount text as the instrument of the research. The finding of this research shown that students' translating quality in translating the recount text got difficult in translating a text from the topic and supporting sentence, with grammatical construction correctly. They were omission, 32.84% misinformation, 40.69% misordering, 8.04% addition, and 18.43%. In general, the quality of students translating the recount text was good. From the results of the research, it can be concluded that most of the student in translating recount text of English Department of Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University had a fair in standard and quality. It can be suggested that students have to master grammar because grammar contributes to the mastery of translating. The students should read more to enrich their knowledge and improve their grammar mastery, grammar and translating ability. Students should have known what tense that can be used when they wrote the text. In addition, the lecturers should get informed of the results of the research, so that they took a benefit or necessary procedures to address the situation. For further researches, it is suggested that the similar types of research should be carried out

with broaden population to analysed and discussed completed factors that influenced the students' ability in translation text.

Introduction

Historically, translation studies have long been *prescriptive* to tell the translators how to translate such a text, to the point that discussions of translation that were not prescriptive were generally not considered to be about translation at all. When historians of translation studies trace early Western thought about translation, for example, they most often set the beginning at Cicero's remarks on how he used translation from Greek to Latin to improve his oratorical abilities-an early description of what Jerome ended up calling sense-for-sense translation. The descriptive history of interpreters in Egypt provided by Herodotus several centuries earlier is typically not thought of as translation studies-presumably because it does not tell translators how to translate. In China, the discussion on how to translate originated with the translation of Buddhist sutras during the Han Dynasty. At about the same time, the Interpretive Theory of Translation that introduced the notion of deverbalised sense into translation studies, distinguishing word correspondences and sense equivalences, and showing the difference between dictionary definitions of words and phrases (word correspondences) and the sense of texts or fragments thereof in a given context (sense equivalences). Learning about the long history of the translation it told us about how important translation as one of the important skill in English Language Skill. The usages for translating a text or even translated the discourse directly called interpretation (spoken translation).

Nowadays, in this globalisation era, people are required to master other languages to communicate the ideas in daily life. English is one of the important languages used in this era. In mastering the language, there are four skills that should be mastered; they are reading, listening, writing, and speaking. To master them, people need the ability of language translation from the source language (SL) to target language (TL). Brislin (1976, p. 1) stated that translation is the general term referring to the transfer of thoughts and ideas from one language to another, whether the languages are in written or oral form, whether the languages have established orthographies or do not have such much standardisation, or whether one or both languages are based on signs, as with sign language or deaf. Consequently, translation cannot be regardless of language ability.

Translation plays an essential role in the communication of many languages. The translation is not an easy task. As stated by Catford (1965, p. 1), an operation performed on languages: a

process of substituting a text in one language for a text in another. The translation is the replacement of textual material in one language (SL) by equivalent textual material in another language (TL). The translator is required to have the rich vocabularies to arrange an equivalent word from the source language (SL) to target language (TL), the semantic and the pragmatic competence without changing the meaning of the source language. As stated by Wilss (1984) that translation is a transfer process which aims at the transformation of a written SL text in an optimally equivalent TL text, and which requires the syntactic, the semantic and the pragmatic understanding and analytical processing of SL. Therefore, English learners are commonly committing the error in translating from the source language (SL) into the target language (TL).

The error in translating is contributed by the various factors. Ellis (1994, p. 49) stated that the errors that learners make could be influenced by a variety of factors, such as; mother tongue or language learning experience. The error in translating caused by the different semantic formula can be found in translating the recount text. The recount text is a genre of text which intended to retell the events or the experiences in the past. According to Palmer (2011, p. 42), a recount is the most common type of non-fiction writing and includes regular "news" or diary writing; accounts of outing and holidays activities; true stories" of events in history. As the function of the recount text itself is to retell the past event, the researcher is interested to know whether are the learners sensitive or not to the structure, pragmatic situation, etc. in translating the recount text to the target language.

From the introduction above, the researcher focused on examining the error in translating the recount text of the students of the fifth semester of English Department of Teacher Training and Education Faculty of Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University. The researchers formulated the problem as follows: What kinds of error are found in the Indonesian-English translation on the recount text performed by the fifth-semester students of English Education Department? What is the primary cause of error in the Indonesian-English translation on the recount text performed by the fifth-semester students of English Education Department?

The objectives of the research were to find out the error which frequently performed by the fifth-semester students of English Department of Teacher Training and Education Faculty of Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University. To find out the primary cause of error in the Indonesian-English translation on the recount text performed the fifth semester of English Department of Teacher Training and Education Faculty of Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University.

In this research, the researchers used a qualitative research method by implementing a content analysis research design. According to Creswell (2012, p. 16), a qualitative research method was aimed to explore a problem and develop a detailed understanding of a central phenomenon. Furthermore, the design for this research was a content analysis research

design. This design was used in examined the data into specific categories. As stated by Dornyei (2007, p. 245), content analysis is associated with qualitative research, since the qualitative analytical method of examining written text that involves the counting of instances of words, phrases, or grammatical structures that fall into specific categories.

The subject of this research was the students of the fifth semester of English Department of Teacher Training and Education Faculty of Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University. The researchers used of recount text as the text of the translation, that translated by the students. The researchers asked the participants to translate the recount text from Indonesian to the English language. Indonesia centred zones "Journey to Boyolali, Enjoying Fruity Ice" In analysing, the data the researchers used Miles and Huberman (1994, p. 10) Data Reduction, Data Display, and Conclusion.

Theoretical Framework
Translation

The translation is a process of transformation from the source language (SL) to another language (TL). Catford (1965) stated that translation is the replacement of textual material in one language (SL) by equivalent textual material in another language (TL). In translation, the translator or the learner needs to be well understood to the difference of syntactic, semantic, and pragmatic in the source language and the target language. In accordance to Wilss (1984) translation is a transfer process, which aims at the transformation of a written SL text in an optimally equivalent TL text, and which, requires the syntactic, the semantic and the pragmatic understanding and analytical processing of SL. Moreover, in doing the translation, the translator or the learner not only find out the equivalent material in the target language but also keep the meaning of the source language (SL).

On the other hand, Brislin (1976, p. 1) stated that translation is the general term referring to the transfer of thoughts and ideas from one language to another, whether the languages are in written or oral form, whether the languages have established orthographies or do not have such much standardisation, or whether one or both languages are based on signs, as with sign language or deaf.

Based on those statements, translation is the process in getting the meaning from Source Language (SL) into Target Language (TL) by determining the difference of syntactic, semantic, and pragmatic for getting the information both language. The translator must be careful to understand the content and the culture binderies of the language to get the equivalence in meaning.

There are several types of translation, according to Jacobson (2004, p. 139). He divided three types of translation, which are consisted of:

1. Intra-lingual translation or rewarding. This is an interpretation of verbal signs using other sign of the same language.
2. Interlingual translation or translation proper. The translation is an interpretation of verbal signs using some other language.
3. Inter-semiotic translation or transmutation. The translation is an interpretation of verbal signs using signs of non-verbal sign system.

Besides that, Dolet (1540/1997) set out five principles in order of importance as follows:

1. The translator must perfectly understand the sense and material of the original author, although he/he should feel free to clarify obscurities.
2. The translator should have a perfect knowledge of both SL and TL, so as not to lessen the majesty of the language.
3. The translator should avoid word-for-word renderings.
4. The translator should avoid Latinate and unusual forms.
5. The translator should assemble and liaise words eloquently to avoid clumsiness

Error

According to Richards (2010, p. 201), the error is the use of a linguistic item (e.g. a word, a grammatical item, a speech act, etc.) in a way, which a fluent or native speaker of the language regards as showing faulty or incomplete learning. It means that error is something that is not supposed to be. Making error means that there are the language norms are violated. Ellis (1994, p. 51) defines errors as a deviation from the norms of the target language.

In learning language, making an error is unavoidable. There are many factors that caused the error; one of them is the different structure of the mother tongue with the target language (TL). Ellis (1994, p. 49) also stated that the errors that the learners make could be influenced by a variety of factors, such as; mother tongue or language learning experience.

According to Ellis (1994, p. 18) that errors have been identified, they can describe and classified into types. One way is to classify errors into grammatical categories. They are consisted of:

1. Omission
An omission is when leaving out an item that is required for an utterance to be considered grammatical. For example, the learners often leave out the third person singular morpheme -s,

the plural marker -s, and the past tense inflection -ed. The error that might be happened as follow:

"I play football last night", instead of "I played football last night."

2. Misinformation

Misinformation happened when using the grammatical form in place of another grammatical. For example, the use of small instead of smaller, and the use of was playing instead of were playing.

3. Disordering

Disordering considered when putting the words in an utterance in the wrong order. This kind of error can be found when the learners said: "He is woke upping now", the learner attaches the inflection–ing to the particle of the two words verb "wake up".

4. Addition

The addition is the opposite of omission errors. They are characterised by the presence of an item which must not be presented in a well-formed utterance. The example of this error as follows:

a) They did not come here (came must be revised become come).
b) Womans (womans must be revised become women).
c) I am is a nurse (is must not exists).

According to Richards in Ellis (1994, p. 58), there are three sources or causes of errors which consisted of:

1. Interference errors occur as a result of 'the use of elements from one language while speaking another.
2. Intralingual errors reflect the general characteristics of rule learning such as faulty generalisation, incomplete application of rules and failure to learn condition under which rules apply. Intralingual errors are subdivided into four divisions, as follows:

a) Overgeneralisation
Overgeneralisation happens when the learners create a false structure based on other structure in the target language. For example: when the learners make sentences in the use of present perfect tense, they add the ending –ed or –d in the infinitive verb.

b) Ignorance of Rule Restriction

Ignorance of rule restriction involves the application of the rule of contexts where they do not apply. Here, the learners fail to observe the restriction of structure. Ignorance of rule restriction will happen when the learners put the wrong auxiliary between the subject and the verb.

c) Incomplete Application of Rules

Incomplete application rules produce unacceptable utterances. Therefore; the learners should mastering the rule of question usage.

d) False Concept Hypothesised

False concept hypothesise faced by the learners, which is derived from faulty comprehension of distractions in the target language.

3. Development errors occur when the learner attempts to build up hypotheses about the target language based on limited experience.

In this research, the researcher focused on analysed the students' translation quality on identified their error in translating the text by determined their error. According to Kutz (1998), "Error analysis, as a descriptive rather than a prescriptive approach to error, provides a methodology for determining why a student makes a particular grammatical error and has been a potentially valuable borrowing from this field of the research in second-language acquisition, one that could have altered the prescriptive drilling of standard forms which still comprises much of basic writing texts. Unfortunately, however, error analysis in the composition classroom has generally served to keep the focus on error simply,"

Recount Text

The recount text is a genre of the text, which intended to retell the events or the experiences in the past. As stated by Hyland (2004, p. 29) is to reconstruct past experiences by retelling events in the original sequence. Furthermore, the recount text is commonly the fact that happened in the past. According to Palmer (2011, p. 42), a recount is the most common type of non-fiction writing and includes regular "news" or diary writing; accounts of outing and holidays activities; true stories" of events in history. Recount text has a generic structure which consisted of orientation, events, and re-orientation. First, orientation gives the background information on what, where, and when. In addition, for the second, events are a series of paragraphs that retell the events in the order in which they happened—the third, re-orientation. The orientation is a concluding paragraph as a part of concluding remarks in the text.

According to Linda and Peter (2002, p.177), a recount text is a text that telling the reader about one story, action or activity so that the readers' feel the story. Its goal is to entertain or informing the reader. In other hands, the recount is a text, which retells event or experiences in the past. There are many kinds of text, such as procedure, narrative, descriptive, report, recount, etc. In this study, the writer focused on the recount text. Recount text is a text that retells past events. The purpose of a recount is to give the audience a description of what occurred and when it occurred. Orientation, events, and re-orientation is the generic structure of recount text. Recount text divided into five types: (1) Personal Recount: This usually retells an event that the writer was personally involved in; (2) Biography Recount: this usually retells accounts of a person "s life; (3) Factual Recount. This usually retells an incident, for example, a science experiment, police report; (4) Imaginative Recount: the writer writes an imaginary role and giving details of events in the recounts, for example, a day in the life of a pirate; a story of a mango tree; and (5) Historical Recount: this retells historical events in the past.

Findings and Discussions

After the researchers processed the data from 40 students of English Department of Teacher Training and Education Faculty of Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University, the researchers found that 548 errors. In general, the errors were divided into four categories; those are Ommision category with 180 errors, Misinformation category with 223 errors, Addition category with 101 errors, and Misordering category with 44 errors. Here the percentage of errors from students in translating recounts text, as shown in Table 4.1, The Percentage of Errors from Students in Translating Recount Text.

Table 4.1 The Percentage of Errors from Students in Translating Recount Text

No.	Errors	Quantity	Percentage
1.	Omission	180	32.84%
2.	Misinformation	223	40.69%
3.	Misordering	44	8.04%
4.	Addition	101	18.43%
Total		**548**	**100%**

For the omission error, at least there were four pieces of evidence mostly occurred from 180 data. For the first: similarly, the sweet and soft taste when eaten is the reason why people like this fruit. Second, not only can be eaten immediately, now various culinary delights present a variety of servings of the fruit. The third, when it reached in the front, the typical fragrance of fruit immediately spread. The four or the last, sweetie glutinous rice, which is the basic ingredient, consists of white glutinous.

For misinformation error, there were three most occurred from 223 data, first: Glutinous rice, which is the basic ingredient, consists of white sweetie glutinous ice. For the second, Can be given additional sweetener from sweetened condensed. And the last, as if it's always wanted to come back to enjoy it again.

For misordering error, there were two mostly occurred from 44 data. First, the fruit is served through a kind of culinary ice, like sweetie glutinous ice. Second, not only can it be eaten immediately, now various culinary delights present a variety of servings of fruit ice.

For addition errors, there were three mostly occurred from 101 data. First, when it is in reason, durian sellers on the roadside are almost always crowded by buyers. Second, the fruit is quite popular with Indonesia people. The third, enough to walk around the road that surrounds the statue, then there will be writing fruit ice cream and sweetie glutinous ice seller.

According to the errors found in each category, the researcher processed another data based on how frequent the errors are repeated from 40 students of English Department of Teacher Training and Education Faculty of Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University. The data are shown in Table 4.2, the repetition of errors from students translating recount text.

Table 4.2: The Repetition of Errors from Students Translating Recount Text

No.	Errors	Category	Quantity	Percentage (a)	Percentage (b)
1.	When eaten	O	23	12.7%	57.5%
2.	Not only can be eaten	O	16	8.8%	40%
3.	Spread	O	26	14.4%	65%
4.	Consist	O	12	6.6%	30%
5.	Sweetie glutinous ice	MI	12	5.38%	30%
6.	Added with sweetened condensed	MI	25	11.2%	62.5%
7.	As if	MI	32	14.34%	80%
8.	Almost always	A	38	37.6%	95%
9.	Fruit	A	11	10.89%	27.5%
10.	Will be writing	A	19	18.8%	47.5%
11.	Culinary ice	MO	25	56.8%	62.5%
12.	Not only can it be eaten	MO	30	68.18%	75%

From the table above, the researchers concluded that there are 12 data from each category that as the most repetition from 40 students. After the researcher processed the data, it showed that the students have not fully understood how to translate a recount text according to the proper grammar use. From the 548 errors, misinformation category has the most

number of errors with 223; omission has the second most number of errors with 180; followed by addition with 101 errors, and the last is misordering with 44 errors. In this discussion part, the researcher will elaborate on how the errors should be written according to the most repeated errors from each category.

a. Omission errors

According to Ellis (1994), omissions are the absence of an item that must appear in a well-formed utterance. In this type of error, the learners omit one of the elements in the correct sentence. Any morpheme or word in a sentence is potential for the omission.

In this research, four errors have the most number of repetition from 180 data.

1. Similarly, the sweet and soft taste when eaten is the reason why this fruit is liked by people.
2. Not only can be eaten immediately, now various culinary delights present a variety of servings of the fruit.
3. When it reached in the front, the typical fragrance of fruit immediately spread.
4. Sweetie glutinous rice, which is the basic ingredient, consists of white glutinous).

b. Misinformation errors

Dulay in Ellis (1994, p. 56) states that Misinformations are the use of the wrong form of the morpheme or structure. This error occurs when the learners apply the grammar rules of the target language incorrectly.

1. Glutinous rice, which is the basic ingredient, consists of white sweetie glutinous ice.
2. Can be given additional sweetener from sweetened condensed.
3. As if it always wanted to come back to enjoy it again.

c. Addition errors

According to Dulay in Ellis (1994, p. 56), Additions are the presence of an item that must not appear in well-formed utterances. Additions are the opposite of omission. It occurs when the learners add one or more elements which should not exist in a correct sentence. This error happens because the learners are too careful in using the rule of the target language in this type of error.

1. When it is in reason, durian sellers on the roadside are almost always crowded by buyers.
2. The fruit is quite popular with Indonesia people.
3. Enough to walk around the road that surrounds the statue, then there will be writing fruit ice cream and sweetie glutinous ice seller.

d. Misordering errors

According to Dulay in Ellis (1994, p. 56), Misorderings are the incorrect placement of a morpheme or group of morphemes in an utterance. This type of error occurs when the learners place the sequence of words inappropriately in the sentence. This error frequently takes place in direct and indirect speech.

1. Usually, the fruit is served through a kind of culinary ice, like sweetie glutinous ice.
2. Not only can it be eaten immediately, now various culinary delights present a variety of servings of fruit ice.

Conclusion

Based on the results of the research, the researchers concluded that the students of the fifth semester of English Department of Teacher Training and Education Faculty of Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa University got difficulties in translating a recount text from the topic and supporting sentence, with grammatical construction correctly. They were Omission, 32.84% Misinformation, 40.69% misordering, 8.04% Addition, 18.43% and the Total 100%. In general, the quality of students translating a recount text was good. It can be suggested that students have to master grammar because grammar contributes to the mastery of translating. Besides that, students should read more to enrich their knowledge and improve their grammar mastery, grammar and translating ability. Students should have known what tense that can be used when they wrote the text. In addition, the lecturers should get informed of the results of the research, so that they took a benefit or necessary procedures to address the situation. For the further researches, it is suggested that the similar types of the research should be carried out with broaden population in order to analysed and discussed completed factors that influenced the students' ability in translation text.

REFERENCES

Brown, H. D. (2000). *Principles of language learning and teaching.* Fourth Edition. New York: Longman.

Catford, J.C. (1965). *A linguistic theory of translation: An essay in applied linguistics.* London: OUP.

Cresswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational research planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research.* Fourth Edition. United States of America: Pearson.

Dolet, E. (1540/1997). La manière de bien traduire d'une langue en aultre, Paris: J. de Marnef, translated by D. G. Ross as 'How to translate well from one language into another', in D. Robinson (ed.) (1997b), pp. 95–7.

Dornyei, (2007). *Research method in applied linguistics.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Ellis, R. (1994). *The study of second language acquisition.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Cowan, J. (2008). *The teacher's grammar of English with answer: A course book and reference guide.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Craighead, W.E. Nemeroff, C.B. (2004). *The Concise Corsini Encyclopedia of Psychology and Behavioral Science.* New Jersay: John Wiley & Sons.

Curtis, S. (2009). *Perfect puntuation.* New York: Random House.

Ganeri, A. (2013). *Punctuation: Commas, full stops, and question marks.* London: Raintree.

Gay, L.R., Mills, G.E. and Airasian, P. (2009). *Educational research: Competencies for analysis and aplcation: (Third Edition).* New York: Merril Publishing Company.

Kutz, E. (1998). Between students' language and academic discourse: Interlanguage as middle ground. *Negotiating Academic Literacies*, edited by Vivian Zamel and Ruth Spack. Lawrence Erlbaum.

Lederer, M. (2003). *Translation – The interpretive model*, Manchester: St. Jerome.

Miles and Huberman, (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook.* Second Edition. London: Sage.

Richard, J. C. (2010). *Language teaching and applied linguistics.* London: Longman.

Kress, G. (2005). *Early spelling: From convention to creativity*. London: Routledge.

Krishnaswarny, K.N. Sivakumar, A. I. Mathrajan, M. (2009). *Management research methdology: Integration of principles, method and technique*. New Delhi: Pearson Educational India.

Kroeger, P.R. (2005). *Analyzing grammar: An introduction*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.